DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 457 928 JC 010 685

| | |
|---|---|
| AUTHOR | Williams, Lillian Hoggard |
| TITLE | Faculty and Multicultural Education: An Analysis of the Levels of Curricular Integration within a Community College System. |
| PUB DATE | 2000-12-00 |
| NOTE | 165p.; Doctoral Dissertation, College of William and Mary. |
| PUB TYPE | Dissertations/Theses - Doctoral Dissertations (041) |
| EDRS PRICE | MF01/PC07 Plus Postage. |
| DESCRIPTORS | *Community Colleges; Curriculum Development; *Diversity (Institutional); *Educational Planning; Futures (of Society); *Minority Groups; *Multicultural Education; Nontraditional Students; *Teacher Attitudes; Two Year Colleges |

ABSTRACT

The United States population is projected to increase from 249 million in 1990 to 355 million by 2040, with minorities constituting more than half of the total population and a disproportionately large segment of the workforce. With changing demographics and increasing economic globalization, educational institutions will be confronted with reforming their curricula to meet new societal needs by promoting knowledge and understanding of different cultures This study's purpose was to determine the levels of multicultural education integrated into the general education courses that are requirements for completion of selected degree programs. Further, it was designed to identify the factors that influenced faculty members to include multicultural education into their courses. Levels of integration of multicultural education were determined from faculty interviews and supported by evidence presented in the syllabi, tests, and handouts. Analysis of the interviews provided the factors that motivate faculty members to infuse their classes with multicultural perspectives. It was concluded that the amount of multiculturalism included in the courses vary from none to considerable and is determined by the faculty member's commitment to achieving pluralism. Factors that motivate inclusion of multicultural perspectives are the disciplines, institutional atmosphere, and personal values of the faculty. (Contains 48 references.) (KP)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 457 928

# FACULTY AND MULTICULTURAL EDUCATION: AN ANALYSIS OF THE LEVELS OF CURRICULAR INTEGRATION WITHIN A COMMUNITY COLLEGE SYSTEM

---

A Dissertation

Presented to

The Faculty of the School of Education

The College of William and Mary in Virginia

---

In Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirement for the Degree

Doctor of Education

---

by

Lillian Hoggard Williams

December 2000

JC 010 685

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

L H Williams.

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

# FACULTY AND MULTICULTURAL EDUCATION:
# AN ANALYSIS OF THE LEVELS OF CURRICULAR INTEGRATION WITHIN A COMMUNITY COLLEGE SYSTEM

by

Lillian Hoggard Williams

Approved August 2000 by

Dorothy E. Finnegan

Dorothy E. Finnegan, Ph.D.
Chairperson of Doctoral Committee

Roger G. Baldwin, Ph.D.

David W. Leslie, Ed.D.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

© 2000

Lillian Hoggard Williams

All Rights Reserved

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ........ vii

List of Figures ........ viii

Abstract ........ ix

CHAPTER ONE - INTRODUCTION ........ 2

  Problem Statement ........ 5

  Research Questions ........ 6

  Limitations and Delimitations ........ 7

  Definition of Terms ........ 7

CHAPTER TWO - REVIEW OF LITERATURE ........ 9

  Definitions of Multiculturalism ........ 15

  Historical and Literary Canons ........ 16

CHAPTER THREE - CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK ........ 22

  Banks' Typology ........ 23

  Schuster and van Dyne's Stages ........ 28

  Methodology ........ 30

  Population Sample ........ 31

  Procedures ........ 31

CHAPTER FOUR - THE INSTITUTIONS ........ 34

  Marantz Community College System ........ 34

  Upstate Community College ........ 36

  Greenfield Community College ........ 41

Flatlands Community College ........ 46

Comparison and Contrast ........ 51

CHAPTER FIVE - INTEGRATION LEVELS OF FACULTY ........ 53

Levels of Integration ........ 53

Level One: The Exclusion Approach ........ 54

Level Two: The Contributions Approach ........ 60

Level Three: The Additive Approach ........ 61

Level Four: The Transformation Approach ........ 69

Level Five: The Decision-Making and Social Action Approach ........ 86

Level Six: The Integrated Approach ........ 87

Summary ........ 90

CHAPTER SIX - MOTIVATIONAL FACTORS ........ 95

The Influential Forces ........ 94

The Institutional Environment ........ 97

The Disciplines ........ 107

General Education ........ 113

Conclusions ........ 118

Recommendations ........ 126

Recommendation for the System ........ 126

Recommendation for Administration at Member Institutions ........ 129

Recommendation for the General Education Faculty ........ 131

Recommendations for Further Research ........ 133

APPENDICES

Appendix A - Letter to Provost or President .... 136

Appendix B - Letter to Faculty Member .... 138

Appendix C - Interview Questions .... 140

Figure 1- An Analytical Matrix of Multicultural Course Content .... 141

Figure 2 - Distribution of General Education Courses by Institution and Discipline .... 144

References .... 145

Vita .... 151

# Acknowledgements

Focus and direction for this project was given more intensity by the patient and wise counsel of my advisor, Dr. Dorothy E. Finnegan. Much gratitude is extended for her guidance and encouragement. Also, many thanks to Dr. Roger Baldwin and Dr. David Leslie for serving on my committee.

I would like to thank many individuals at J. Sargeant Reynolds Community College for their advice and support, especially the personnel in the Learning Resources Center - Downtown Campus. Thanks also to the administrations and faculty members of the participating institutions in my research.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge and thank my family, Oyin, McCray and Erica, for their support and encouragement, and especially, my husband Charles, for his editorial guidance and his determined encouragement of me in this effort.

# List of Figures

Figure 1. Analytic Matrix of Multicultural Course Content

Figure 2. Distribution of General Education Courses by Institution and Discipline

# FACULTY AND MULTICULTURAL EDUCATION

# AN ANALYSIS OF THE LEVELS OF CURRICULAR INTEGRATION WITHIN A COMMUNITY COLLEGE SYSTEM

## Abstract

The composition of the United States population and its workforce is changing rapidly with a projected increase from 249 million in 1990 to 355 million by the year 2040. Current minorities will constitute more than half of the nation's total population and comprise a disproportionately large segment of the workforce. With changing demographics and increasing economic globalization, America's educational institutions will be confronted with reforming their curricula to meet new societal needs by promoting knowledge and understanding of different cultures.

The purpose of this study was to determine the levels of multicultural education integrated into the general education courses that are requirements for completion of selected AAS degree programs. Further, it was designed to identify the factors that influenced faculty members to include multicultural education into their courses.

Levels of integration of multicultural education were determined from faculty interviews and supported by evidence presented in the syllabi, tests, and handouts. Analysis of the interviews provided the factors that motivate faculty members to infuse their classes with multicultural perspectives.

It was concluded that the amount of multiculturalism included in the courses vary from none to considerable and is determined by the faculty member's commitment to achieving pluralism. Factors that motivate inclusion of multicultural perspectives are the disciplines, institutional atmosphere, and personal values of faculty.

Further study is needed to determine how much of the multicultural perspective students retain from the general education courses. A comparison between two and four-year colleges is needed to help determine whether only community college instructors are deficient in the amount of multicultural education they infuse into their disciplines.

# FACULTY AND MULTICULTURAL EDUCATION:
# AN ANALYSIS OF THE LEVELS OF CURRICULAR INTEGRATION WITHIN A COMMUNITY COLLEGE SYSTEM

# CHAPTER ONE

## Introduction

Even though the United States population and its workforce are increasing at a very slow pace, their composition is changing rapidly. Racial and ethnic minorities are projected to constitute 29 percent of the labor market by the turn of the twenty-first century. According to the 1989 Census Bureau projections, the white population of the United States will only grow about 25 percent during the next four decades. During the same 40 year period, the African-American population is projected to grow by 68 percent, the Asian-American, Pacific Island-American and the American Indian populations are projected to grow by 79 percent, and the Latino and Hispanic populations of the United States are projected to soar by 187 percent. By 2080, according to Population Reference Bureau projections, the United States population may well be composed of 24 percent Latino, 15 percent African-American, and 12 percent Asian-American (Cortes, 1991).

The changing composition of the United States population, according to Do (1996), is due mainly to the "immigration and high ethnic birth rate. The United States population is projected to grow from 249 million in 1990 to 355 million in 2040; immigrants arriving since 1990 and their children will account for two-thirds of that growth" (p. 9). "Minorities", therefore, will constitute more than half of the nation's total population by the middle of the next century (Cortes 1991) and comprise a disproportionately large segment of the workforce (Wallin 1996).

During the latter half of the twentieth century an information economy emerged revolutionizing the labor and management of manufacturing and agricultural workforces in the United States and other countries. Economic expansion beyond the United States boundaries is resulting in cooperation, contact, exchange, and competition among people of other cultures. No longer can Americans assume that foreign partners and competitors must adopt our languages and culture in order to prosper internationally. Neither can Americans continue to ignore the languages and cultures of others and expect to remain among the world's leaders economically (Bowser, 1995).

With changing demographics and increasing economic globalization, American educational institutions are being confronted with the need to change their curriculum to meet new societal needs. One such need is to promote knowledge and understanding of different cultures to their students. If society and higher education are reflective of each other (Altbach et al., 1994) and most institutional mission statements charge faculty to educate leaders and to train the workforce, higher education must undertake new challenges in facilitating the transition from the classroom to the rapidly diversifying workforce.

Much of the challenge to educate the nation's occupational-technical workforce with knowledge and understanding of different cultures will fall on the shoulders of the community college. To successfully meet the challenge of educating the technical workforce, a change in the way some community college academicians think, from the traditional Eurocentric dominant culture to a more global perspective, must occur.

The community college was created as *the* higher education institution that would unconditionally serve *all* members of the community. With an open door access policy and low tuition, the primary goal of the "peoples' college" has been to provide the first two years of a baccalaureate degree. At the advent of the twenty-first century, community colleges find themselves face to face with the challenge of serving a more diverse student body. According to Piland (1996),

> Community colleges are multicultural institutions of higher education. The students, faculty, and staffs are diverse. Nationally, more than 25% of all community college students are people of color. By the year 2020, demographers predict, minorities will compose nearly one third of the country's population and nearly half of the school-age youth. These substantial increases in numbers and percentages of ethnically diverse people in the United States will be reflected in the community college student, faculty, and staff populations. (p. iii)

Because of the open door policy, community colleges are the "vehicle of access to the mainstream for millions of immigrants, minorities, women, first generation college students and other marginalized groups" (Wallin, 1996, p. 24).

The community college has a vital role to play in preparing students for technical careers to maintain a strong and competitive workforce in America (Wallin, 1996). Graduates of occupational-technical programs enter the workforce immediately upon completion of the two-year degree requirements and some may never attend another educational institution. Wallin (1996) argues "if students do not have the opportunity to discuss issues in a multicultural context in these first-year basic courses, they may have even less opportunity as they get into their more highly specialized course work " (p. 30). Community college students who transfer to complete their baccalaureate degree and four-year college students have at least two more years to attain an understanding, respect and knowledge of other cultures.

Traditionally, the community college curriculum has devalued, ignored and treated the needs of women, students of color, and others on the margin of society as peripheral (Stoll, 1994-95). Community college faculty and administrators can no longer ignore the demographic changes which have occurred and must broaden its mission and curriculum to encompass a perspective that will include the values, customs, and history of racial and ethnic minority groups (Ramsey, Vold and Williams, 1989; Wallin, 1996). A global perspective will ensure that all students, regardless of ethnicity, gender, religion, or race, will experience equal representation and voice in a democratic environment.

## Problem Statement

While multicultural education may have been seen as peripheral in most community college curricula, it has to become an integral part of educating and training America's technical workforce. If a two-year degree program may be the only chance for vocational graduates to encounter a multicultural dimension in higher education, it is essential to identify what, if anything, is being taught to the vocational student regarding the understanding, respect and knowledge of other cultures in order to effect reform. Thus, using a modified version of Banks' (1993) typology of approaches to integrate multicultural education into the curriculum, I assessed the degree to which the course content of general education courses taught to students in three occupational-technical programs in three community colleges in one state system integrate multicultural education into the curriculum.

Since faculty members interact with students daily and are charged with imparting knowledge, their cooperation is key to the successful integration of multicultural education into the curriculum. Therefore, participating faculty members were interviewed regarding his/her philosophy of discipline teaching.

Questions that guided this study are:

1. To what extent does the course content (syllabi, handouts, tests, goals/objectives, tests and class activities) reflect a commitment by individual faculty and academic professionals to multicultural education?
2. To what extent does the teaching philosophy of faculty members reflect a commitment to integration of multicultural education?
3. To what extent does the integration of multicultural education arise from initiative of individual faculty or from the administration or from faculty mandate?

4. What level of integration of multicultural education does the course content and the philosophy of the faculty who design and teach it represent according to the modified Banks typology?

5. What level of integration of multicultural education then is represented in the curriculum of specific occupational-technical degree programs?

## Limitations and Delimitations

The study was delimited to three community colleges in the same state system. In order to maintain consistency, the three community colleges offered the same three Associate in Applied Science degree programs: Business Management, Electronics and Nursing. The study was limited to interviewing faculty members who teach general education courses in the selected occupational-technical programs. Because participation in the study was voluntary, a number of faculty members declined to be interviewed. Therefore the number, ethnicity, and gender of faculty members could not be analyzed.

## Definitions of Terms

For the purpose of this study, **multicultural education** is an educational reform movement designed to structure curricula so that all students, regardless of their gender, ethnicity, race, culture, religion or socioeconomic status, may be empowered with the knowledge and exposed to positive attitudes needed to function in this culturally and ethnically diverse nation. **Course content** includes syllabi, handouts, tests, goals/objectives, class activities and the catalog course descriptions. **Occupational-Technical (OT)** programs are those academic programs in the community college that are designed to prepare students, as technicians, paraprofessionals and skilled craftspersons, for immediate employment upon completion of degree requirements. OT programs include, but are not limited to, Hospitality Management, Civil Engineering, Drafting and Design, Business Management, Respiratory Therapy, Nursing, Computer Programming, Electronics, Administration of Justice, Community and Social Services and Horticulture. I chose Nursing, Business Management, and Electronics to assess in this study.

# CHAPTER TWO

## Review of Literature

Significant demographic changes have occurred in the United States since the 1965 elimination of the "national origin" quotas that favored Europeans. For the first time in the history of the United States, emigrants from Asia, Latin America, and the Caribbean outnumber those of European origin. This new wave of immigration accounts for the increased number of Asian-Americans and Latinos in the current United States population (Hu-DeHart, 1993). America's fast expanding immigrant population challenges current social norms. According to Auster (1994)

> Adding to the already profound social disarray in this country, the continuing influx of well over a million legal and illegal immigrants per year, 90 per cent of them from Third World Countries, is feeding a host of cultural ills that may well prove incurable: the loss of a common language, common literature, and common national identity. Underlying all these problems is the steady decline of Americans of European descent from majority toward minority status, with the concomitant redefinition of America as a "multicultural" nation–an oxymoron if there ever was one. (p. 48)

The influx of emigrants to the United States raises the issue of assimilation. Assimilation, as defined by Webster's New World Dictionary (1994) is the "cultural absorption of a minority group into the main cultural body" (p. 83). The questions then become whether or not immigrants should strive toward assimilation and if they choose to resist assimilation, will that resistance negatively impact the larger culture. The nineteenth and early twentieth century immigrants as a direction, rather than as an accomplishment viewed assimilation. For the majority of the early immigrants from Europe, assimilation was a reality and the normative expectation. The desire for immigrants was

> ...to become Americans, to become a part of the culture, to learn a new language--in short to become apart of that great melting pot. The vision of the melting pot saw all peoples who came to America as becoming one--one in mind, one in philosophy, one in goals and objectives, sharing one monocultural view of what it meant to be an American. (Wallin, 1996, p. 25)

The dominant Western European American culture, directed primarily by middle and upper class White Anglo-Saxon Protestants (WASPs), encouraged assimilation. It was ideal for the industrial society because it helped to foster a homogeneous workforce. Additionally, WASPs saw assimilation as a means to maintain their authority and to control the immigrant population. The underlying assumption of assimilation is that all newcomers must adapt in order to receive the economic benefits. With assimilation, opportunities to attain socioeconomic goods such as education and prestigious jobs abound, cultural differences diminish, and social intermixing occurs across ethnic lines, which result in high rates of ethnic intermarriages and mixed ancestry (Alba, 1995).

That assumption still exists today among some members of the dominant culture as demonstrated by Lagon and Lind, who declared, "we favor immigration on the condition that immigrants assimilate rather than disrupt the integrity of the United States (as quoted by Auster, 1994) in response to attacks on their theory of cultural separatism.

In recent years resistance to the melting pot has increased. Instead, according to Wallin (1996), "racial, ethnic, and religious groups demand the right to be--and to remain--proudly different" (p. 25). Even though the underlying purpose of assimilation today is still the opportunity to improve one's economic and social status,

> The idea has fallen into disrepute [and is] replaced by the slogan of multiculturalism. At best, assimilation is considered of dubious relevance for contemporary minorities, who are believed to want to remain outside the fabled "melting pot" and to be, in any event, not wholly acceptable to white America. (Alba, 1995, p. 3)

Contemporary minorities have latched on to the theory of cultural pluralism as an alternative to the melting pot theory. According to Bennett (1995), cultural pluralism is a process of compromise characterized by mutual appreciation and respect between two or more ethnic groups" (p. 85). This theory is becoming widely acceptable because it allows members of different ethnic groups to conform to practices that are necessary for survival in the American society but still retains many of their cultural ways.

Population trends in California represent the future for other states. By the year 2050, California will be classified as a "majority minority" state because the traditional majority population of European Americans will comprise the numerical minority. The relatively high birthrate and the lower age distribution of people of color means that an increasing number of these people will fill our classrooms and workforce (Hu-DeHart, 1993). The United States population is rapidly becoming more diverse in race, color, religion, ethnicity, and therefore, in language, art, literature and music (Hodgkinson, 1995).

The world's population, about 5.2 billion people, is comprised of people in both developed and undeveloped countries (Hodgkinson, 1995). About 23 percent of that number represent the population of the developed world and include whites, African-Americans, Hispanics and Asians. However, the surprising fact is that only 18 percent of the world's population is of European ancestry, a number that is unlikely to increase because of the low fertility rate among people of European ancestry. People of European ancestry will comprise an even smaller minority in the world community by 2025.

The underdeveloped countries, on the other hand, currently have substantially more childbearing females than those of the developed countries. The "future number of potential mothers is larger than the number of mothers now" (Hodgkinson, 1995, p. 4). Consequently, the potential for increased population growth in that part of the world is great. Hodgkinson concluded that by the Year 2050, three of the top fifteen most populated countries will be Moslem and seven of the fifteen will primarily be composed of people who today are considered minorities. Further, Hodgkinson (1995) concluded that

> Besides having to learn more about and deal with people from China and India, Americans are going to have to be educated to deal with Moslems. American higher education will be called upon to meet this challenge, and not simply out of curiosity or reasons of equity. These growing numbers of Chinese, Indians and Moslems will be necessary markets if Americans plan to continue economic growth into the next century. Corporations will need educated staff who can work and compete in these cultures. (p. 5)

Economically, educating as many citizens as possible about the attitudes and way of life of other cultures will best serve the nation. Willard (1993) observed, "educators are not serving their students well if they are not preparing them to have the knowledge, skills, and empathies to function in a world culture" (p. 20). The typical worker of the year 2000 and beyond is going to have to be broad-minded and culturally aware of the diversity in the United States in order to function in a workplace that employs a diverse population. How else are American businesses and industries going to maintain the 800 plus major alliances with businesses in other countries? The economic and demographic changes in the world's community point towards a multicultural future in America (Hodgkinson, 1995).

Foster and Herzog (1994) argue that "the ever-increasing non-European, nonwhite population of the United States and the growing power and visibility of women and minority groups have given rise to a greater awareness of the variety of values, perspectives and world views that are possible" (p. 3). This awakening has created objections with the American higher education system and a sense of "being left out" of the curriculum by persons other than those of European ancestry.

During the 1980s very little dissension was heard from the American college and university communities as compared to the vociferous and turmoil social unrest of the 1960s and 1970s. This sedate climate could possibly have been due to a concern for economic security since the job market was tight; a genuine interest in business curriculum that led immediately to employment or a general lack of social consciousness by the then current generation of undergraduates.

However, in the early 1990s rumblings in the American colleges and universities began to stir again by the conservative student activists. The American public was appalled to hear of a proliferation of undergraduate bigotry. At the University of Michigan, for example, very well publicized series of racist incidents occurred (D'Souza, 1991). Similar ugly ethnic episodes on several other campuses produced student protests. These protests were followed by well-intentioned efforts of university administrators to address the incidents by adopting measures, ranging from reform of the "dead white male curriculum" to censorship of controversial speakers.

According to D'Souza (1991), a visit to virtually any American university campus, a talk with some of the undergraduates or a reading of notices posted about workshops is an indication that these racial confrontations on campus are merely symptoms of deep changes under way. These changes "involve not only race relations or social relations of other kinds but the very substance of the curriculum.... (D'Souza, 1991, p. 52). The curricular alteration, sometimes referred to as 'multiculturalism' or "multicultural education" is already occurring with a great deal of discussion.

## Definitions of Multiculturalism

Multiculturalism, according to Gordon and Lubiano (1993), in its simplest form, means "exposure to different cultures" (p. 249). However, simple exposure is meaningless without reconsidering and restructuring the ways in which knowledge is organized, disseminated and used. In an attempt to encompass all facets of the different cultures, Gaff (1992) defined multiculturalism as "a study of topics as disparate as the life of various ethnic groups, racial diversity, gender differences, international issues, non-western culture, cross-cultural methodologies, sexual preferences and the physically challenged" (p. 32).

The multicultural education movement is designed to "restructure institutions so that all students, including middle-class white males, will acquire the knowledge, skills and attitudes needed to function effectively in a culturally and ethnically diverse nation and world" (Banks, 1993, p. 27). Race, gender, sexual preferences, ethnicity or class, Banks believes, should not be stumbling blocks to obtaining knowledge of other cultures' lifestyles, religions, languages and social problems. Multiculturalism is viewed by some educators, according to Banks (1993), as an entitlement program and a curricular movement primarily for the exclusive benefit of African-Americans, Hispanics, the poor, women and other victimized groups. Despite all the literature about multicultural education being for all students, the characterization of an entitlement for the "others", remains "strong and vivid in the public imagination, as well as, in the hearts and minds of many teachers and administrators" (Banks, 1993, p. 23).

Critics of multicultural education, among them, Arthur Schlesinger, have stressed the notion that multicultural education is the study of the "other" with the "other" being defined as synonymous with Afrocentric education. "When educators view multicultural education as the study of the "others", it is marginalized and held apart from mainstream education reform" (Banks, 1993, p. 23). Banks (1993) further stated that

> Only when education reform related to diversity is viewed as essential for all students–and as promoting the broad public interest–will it have a reasonable chance of becoming institutionalized in the nation's schools, colleges and universities. (p. 23)

### Historical and Literary Canons

Debates over the literary and historical canons and the implementation of multicultural education into the curriculum are taking place among faculty and critics. According to Banks (1993)

> The debate over the canon and the well-orchestrated attack on multicultural education reflect an identity crisis in American society. The American identity is being reshaped, as groups on the margins of society

> begin to participate in the mainstream and to demand that their visions be reflected in a transformed America (p. 28).

As is the case with any interdisciplinary field, the debates will continue. Discussion is occurring among academic leaders at conferences and in professional papers that indicates the perceived importance of multicultural education, even though the process of integration of curriculum content is slow.

The concept of multicultural education in the undergraduate curriculum has stirred much controversy among faculty in higher education institutions. Two camps have emerged: cultural traditionalists and the multiculturalists. Those in the former group champion the traditional Western European canon. According to Foster and Herzog (1994), the canon is "the traditional Eurocentric body of the best-works-in-our-civilization" (p. 4). Those "best works" range from Socrates to Wittgenstein in Philosophy, and from Homer to James Joyce in literature. Philosophically, Searle (1993) and other cultural traditionalists believe that a liberal education in the United States requires exposure to at least "the best that is known and thought in the world" (p. 92). Further, they believe that the canon is the mechanism to employ in the pursuit of truth (Foster and Herzog, 1994). Traditionalists argue that knowledge of the canon is essential to self-understanding for an educated American since the country is a product of those traditions (Searle, 1993). Nieto (1996) asserts that the knowledge which is most worthy is assumed to already be in place and that "knowledge, in this context, is inevitably European, male, and upper class in the origin and conception" (p. 311). The multiculturalists, according to Howe (1993), "is a grouping of mostly younger teachers, many of them veterans of the 1960s, which includes feminists, black activists, Marxists, deconstructionists, and a mixture of these" (p. 154). Gates (1992) used similar language when loosely defining multiculturalists as "that uneasy, shifting set of alliances formed by feminist critics, critics of the so-called minority culture and Marxists and poststructuralist critics--in short, the rainbow coalition of contemporary critical theory" (p. 190).

Multiculturalists, philosophically view the canon as presenting only one perspective and only one system of value--that of the dominant group--Eurocentric, male and white. They believe that what is being taught is "only a fraction of what is available knowledge, and those who decide what is most important make choices that are of necessity influenced by their own background, education and experience" (Nieto, 1996, p. 312).

With regards to the influence of the Eurocentric body of the best works, Bowser (1995) argues that the contempt and ignorance of the races toward one another in the United States is partially due to the historical dominance of the traditional college curriculum. He explained that a single historic group can no longer dominate the core educational experience and that a superior race and culture can no longer be supported in a country where there are so many different races, socioeconomic classes, and cultures linked and intertwined.

Until recently, no controversy existed between these factions because the dominant Eurocentric majority held the power to determine the boundaries for appropriate knowledge. However, ever since the 1960s' Civil Rights Movement, minorities have challenged the status quo. The 1960s social protest movement was the catalyst for the establishment of academic programs and courses on Chicanos, American Indians, Asians and race relations (Butler and Schmitz. 1992). In addition, women, people with disabilities and other disenfranchised groups imitated Black demands for (1) equality of opportunity, (2) fair depiction in textbooks, and (3) the institutionalization of college-level ethnic courses.

Originally, politics of the 1960s social movement was brought into the classroom disguised as criticism of the traditional Western European canon. Shaw (1994) refers to academicians, political pundits, and students, who objected to the traditional canon, as "canon busters". Canon busters demanded that the exclusion of women and minorities from the traditional Western canons should be corrected. They used as a pretext asking only for an "opening up" of the canon to include those writers who had been excluded, when in actuality, they were challenging the makeup and values of the canon in an attempt to subvert key tenets of the dominant ideology (Shaw, 1994). Clearly, in the 1990s, a genuine concern of the busters was the rational process that produced the canon and not merely the works themselves. Shaw (1994) states

> The understanding that there is a canon–that is, that some works are superior to others–stands out as a particularly eligible target for attacks. It assumes hierarchy, objectivity of judgement, and the existence of an admirable Western tradition. Defenders of the traditional understandings are off the mark when they undertake to defend hierarchy by showing that a particular thing is better than another. (p. 258)

Searle (1993) suggests that the objections to the traditional curriculum go beyond the mere request for increased representation. The central objection, he says, is the history of "Western Civilization, a history which is basically a history of oppression" (p. 93). Searle states,

> The so-called canon of Western civilization consists in the official publications of this system of oppression, and it is no accident that the authors in the canon are almost exclusively Western white males, because the civilization itself is ruled by a caste consisting almost entirely of Western white males. So you can not reform education by admitting new members to the club; by opening up the canon; the whole idea of "the canon" has to be abolished. It has to be abolished in favor of something that is "multicultural" and "nonhierarchical" (1993, p. 93).

In a study of 270 American colleges, universities, and community colleges, discerning the extent to which the institution engaged in specific multicultural curriculum activities, Levin (1992) found that multiculturalism is a major topic of concern of college campuses and that more than half of all colleges and universities have introduced multiculturalism into departmental offerings; research institutions lead in the efforts. Further, he concluded that despite the far greater diversity of the student bodies at two-year colleges, four-year institutions are ahead in every area of cultural diversity examined in the study.

Members of minority groups who finish American high school are more likely to attend a community college. Community colleges "enroll 55 percent of all Hispanic undergraduates, 57 percent of Native American college students, 43 percent of all African American students and 42 percent of all Asian students who attend higher education institutions" (Commission on the Future of Community College, 1988, p. 9). Nationally, "more than 25 percent of all community college students are people of color" (Piland, 1996, p. iii).

Because of the enrollment trends, Takaki (1994) posits that the community college is on the front line of diversity. Concurring with Takaki, Piland (1996) states, "Community colleges are multicultural institutions of higher education. The students, faculty and staffs are diverse" (p. iii). Takaki (1994) further iterates that there is a need "to develop a curriculum that will not alienate students to make sure they stay in school and graduate" (p. 23).

Most American community colleges have egalitarian mission statements that boast that they embrace diversity and pluralism (Stoll, 1994-95). Multicultural education can be a stepping stone to putting those words into practice but it may dictate a transformation in the curriculum. Stoll (1994-95) argues

> Community colleges are in the ideal position to implement multicultural curricular changes at the collegiate level because they are philosophically supportive of meeting diverse student needs; history demonstrates their ability to [make any kind of] change faster than any other type of collegiate institution; and student diversity is greater at community colleges than all other types of higher education institutions. (p. 13)

# CHAPTER THREE

## Conceptual Framework

Community colleges nationwide have idealistic, egalitarian mission statements that proclaim a commitment to diversity and pluralism (Stoll, 1994-95). In reality, the current design of many of the nation's community colleges curricula often devalue or ignore the needs of women, people of color, and any group on the margin of society. Without evidence of some multicultural content in the curriculum, community colleges cannot show a commitment to meeting diverse student needs which they uphold as their philosophical cornerstone (Levine, 1992; Stoll, 1994-95).

Stoll (1994-95) further states "multicultural education can help translate egalitarian principles into practice" (p. 13). This translation requires transforming curricula to include

> The other, whatever that other might be: someone of a different gender, race, class, or national origin; somebody at a greater or lesser distance from the norm; someone outside the set; someone who possesses a different set of characteristics, features, or attributes.... (Madrid, 1990, p. 18).

Since community colleges philosophically support meeting the diverse student needs and have demonstrated the flexibility to change faster than other institutions of higher education, they are in the position to be forerunners of integrating multicultural education into the curricula (Stoll, 1994-95).

### Banks' Typology

In 1993, James Banks published a typology of approaches that faculty members have employed to integrate multicultural content in the curriculum over the last three decades. His four levels of integration are: (1) the contributions approach; (2) the additive approach; (3) the transformation approach; and (4) the social action approach.

Level one, the Contributions Approach, represents an almost 'business as usual' philosophy. In this category, faculty members attempt to integrate ethnic content into the traditional canonical curriculum. However, the mainstream curriculum does not change in its structure, goals, or salient characteristics. Faculty merely insert "heroes and discrete cultural artifacts into the curriculum" (Banks, 1993, p. 198). According to Banks (1993), the prerequisites "for implementation of this approach are minimal. They include basic knowledge about United States society and knowledge about ethnic heroes and their contributions to the society and culture" (p. 198).

The criteria for selecting the ethnic representation to be included is similar to that used to identify western cultural heroes and artifacts. These heroes tend to reinforce the status quo of the dominant social ethos. "Individuals who challenged the dominant society's ideologies, values, and conceptions and advocated radical, social, political, and economic reform are seldom included in the Contributions Approach" (Banks, 1993, p. 198). Consequently, heroes most often studied are Martin Luther King, Jr., Booker T. Washington, Sacajawea, Benjamin Bannaker, and Cesar Chavez; W.E.B. DuBois, Geronimo or Fidel Castro are not.

The Contributions Approach, according to Banks (1993) is the "easiest approach to use to integrate the curriculum" (p. 200), simply because it requires few changes at all. Indeed, adding a hero or two does not even require a change in the teacher's mind set. It does, however, generate some serious limitations. When faculty merely insert a couple of ethnic names and holidays into the heavily Eurocentric dominant curriculum, students do not receive a global view of the roles of different ethnic and cultural groups within the society. Important issues and concepts related to poverty, oppression and victimization of ethnic groups and their struggles are omitted. The contributions approach, used as an appendage to the majority story of the nation's development, simultaneously ignores and fails to help students to discern the role and influence of ethnic groups in shaping the history of the United States (Banks, 1993).

In the Additive Approach, level two, faculty members add certain multicultural ideas, content, themes, and perspectives to the curriculum, but do so without actually changing the basic structure, purpose and characteristics of the lesson plan. For the literature instructor, this may means adding a unit of poetry by a Japanese poet, a book by an African American female, or showing a film on the Harlem Renaissance (Banks, 1993). Banks (1993) cautions

> Content, materials, and issues that are added to a curriculum as appendages instead of being integral parts of a unit of instruction can become problematic. Problems develop because the material [is] used with students who [have] neither the content background nor the attitudinal sophistication to respond to them. Adding ethnic content to the curriculum in a sporadic and segmented way can result in pedagogical problems, trouble for the teacher, student confusion, and community controversy. (p. 202)

When a faculty member merely adds ethnic content into the curriculum, the result is the continuation or maintenance of the normative majority culture. The focus on mainstream Eurocentric historians, writers, artists, and scientists is continued simply because no restructuring of goals, objectives and outcomes takes place. Eurocentric criteria and perspectives, structured and presented so that the current balance of the dominant European cultural power is maintained, are used to identify the concepts, events, and problems to be studied. In most instances, no consideration or mention is given to the "victimized and powerless" (Banks, 1993, p. 202), and the canon and its values remain dominant.

Banks (1993) asserts

> The perspectives of both groups are needed to help us fully understand our history, culture, and society. The people who are conquered and the people who conquered them have histories and cultures that are intricately interwoven and interconnected. They have to learn each other's histories and cultures to understand their own fully. (p. 202)

The Transformation Approach, level three, necessitates more faculty preparation, as it requires changing the basic structure of courses and "enables students to view concepts, issues, themes, and problems from several ethnic perspectives and points of views" (Banks, 1993, p. 203). The major goal in the transformation approach is to have students see concepts from the point of view of "the cultural, ethnic, and racial groups that were the most active participants in, or were most cogently influenced by, the event, issue or concept being studied" (Banks, 1993, p. 203). Germane to curriculum issues here is not the addition of a long list of ethnic groups, heroes and contributions, but the "infusion of various perspectives, frames of references, and content from various groups that will extend students' understanding of the nature, development, and complexity of U. S. society" (Banks, 1993, p. 203). For example, a unit on World War II should highlight, not only the perspectives of the Americans, but also those of the Japanese, the French, the British, and the Germans to assure equal representation and to enable understanding differing views.

The Social Action Approach, level four, incorporates all the elements of the third approach but further requires the faculty to add components and situations that empower students to make decisions and plot the best strategy for solving the problem democratically (Banks, 1993). According to Banks (1993), the "major goals of instruction in this approach are to educate students for social criticism and social change and to teach them decision making skills" (p. 205). Banks (1993) further posits

> A major goal of the social action approach is to help students acquire the knowledge, values, and skills they need to participate in social change so that victimized and excluded ethnic and racial groups can become full participants in U. S. society and so that the nation will move closer to attaining its democratic ideals. To participate effectively in democratic social change, students must be taught social criticism and must be helped to understand the inconsistency between our ideals and social realities, the work that must be done to close this gap, and how students can, as individuals and groups, influence the social and political systems in the U.S. society. (p. 205)

In the Social Action Approach, a great deal of responsibility rests on the faculty members who must place emphasis on definitions and descriptions of societal problems and solutions to these problems. Faculty, as agents of social change, must focus on achieving justice by promoting democratic values and critically analyzing situational ethnic problems. Banks (1993) further iterates that teaching units in this approach will have these components:

1. A decision problem or question
2. An inquiry that provides data related to the decision problem.
3. Value inquiry and moral analysis
4. Decision making and social action (p. 205).

Although Banks' typology may be useful to analyze the approaches to multicultural curriculum reform, two stages of curricular development appear to be missing. Absent is a level in which multicultural education is overlooked entirely. Also absent is a level that suggests total integration and demonstrates the beginning of a new and reformed curriculum. When Schuster and van Dyne (1984) proposed a curriculum change process to place women in the liberal arts, they included stages in which both the absence of women in the curriculum and an integrated curriculum appear.

Schuster and van Dyne's Stages

Schuster and van Dyne's first stage, Invisible Women, is marked by the absence of women from the curriculum; in this type of curriculum women's issues are not taught at all. Since many institutions and courses do not include multicultural content in the curriculum at all, this vacuum must be included in an analysis of the incorporation of multicultural education.

Schuster and van Dyne's (1984) second stage, Search for the Missing Women, parallels Banks' Contributions Approach. Questions such as "Who are the great women? and "Are there female Shakespeares and Darwins, as a mechanism for identifying women are comparable to studying Mexican Americans during the week of May 5 or reciting the "I Have a Dream" speech on January 15 each year.

Their stage three, Women as the Subordinate Group, and Banks' Additive Approach reinforce the idea that women and other disenfranchised groups are not integral parts of the mainstream culture. They both suggest that it is acceptable to include other groups but only as appendages. The existing paradigm does not need to be altered.

Schuster and van Dyne's (1984) fourth stage, Women Studied on Their Own Terms, like the Transformation Approach, gives recognition to women and members of the non-dominant culture. This level of inclusion demonstrates to the student to understand how women and others participated in the formation of the United States society. Basic instructional goals are changed to enable students to study racial, gender and ethnic issues from the perspectives of diverse groups.

Stage five, Women as a Challenge to the Discipline, much like Banks' Social Action Approach calls for identifying social problems, data gathering, improvement of decision-making skills and problem resolutions. Schuster and van Dyne (1984) suggest that questions concerning the validity of historical periods and contributions should surface in this stage. Such questions, according to Banks (1993) will enable students to improve on their thinking, value analyses and social action skills.

Schuster and van Dyne's (1984) sixth stage, The Transformed Curriculum, is without a companion in Banks' design. They describe this stage as the "inclusive vision of human experience" (p. 419). It is characterized by a balanced curriculum and a transformed paradigm. The women recognized that stage six is the ideal and they acknowledged that at their initial writing they were unable to "point to any institution that has entered the millennium" (p. 427).

In order to structure my research around the use of Banks' design of approaches to the integration of multicultural content into the curriculum, I modified his design to include two new levels. The Exclusion Approach, my first stage, promoted through absence the exclusion of any and all multicultural issues and values. Secondly, I included a final level comparable to Schuster and van Dyne's sixth stage, The Transformed Curriculum. My new level, The Integrated Approach, was characterized by the total integration of multicultural content in a course or across courses within a given curriculum.

## Methodology

This study was conducted using information gathered from the Business Management, Electronics, and Nursing Programs from the Flatlands Community College, Upstate Community College and Greenfield Community College of the Marantz Community College System.[1] The Associate in Applied Science (AAS) degree programs were selected because they are offered at all three institutions and prepare students for employment in many technical fields immediately following graduation. Since these institutions are in the same system, the degree requirements are standard for the AAS degree; six semester credits of Written and Oral Communication; six semester credits of Social Sciences, which may be elected from courses in economics, political science, history, sociology or geography; and 44 to 60 semester credits of major area requirements. The Nursing degree, the one exception, may total as many as 72 credits in the major requirements.

---

[1] The names of the community colleges and the statewide system used in this study are pseudonyms.

### Population Sample

After receiving permission from the College of William and Mary School of Education's Human Subjects Committee to proceed with my study, I contacted the President or Provost of each of the three community colleges by letter (see Appendix A) asking for permission to conduct a study on the integration of multicultural education into the curricula of three academic programs at that institution. After institutional permission was granted, the department chairs of each of the identified programs were telephoned to ascertain the names of the faculty members who should be contacted. Since the curricula for occupational-technical programs are packed with discipline-specific courses, I believed that in most cases, I would be referred to the Division of Arts and Sciences or the Division of Humanities at that institution for the appropriate faculty. That proved to be a correct assumption.

### Procedures

After obtaining the names of the Liberal Arts faculty who teach students in the occupational-technical programs, letters (see Appendix B) detailing the purpose of the study were sent to the appropriate faculty members asking for their participation by way of being interviewed on the subject of multicultural education. I planned to interview at least five faculty members per program from each institution. It was possible that the same faculty member may teach students from the three programs, thereby limiting the number of interviews from that institution. Additionally, a great deal more faculty members were asked but declined the invitation. Faculty members were telephoned approximately ten days after letters were mailed to confirm receipt, ask permission, get acquainted, and set appointments.

All participants were asked if they had objections to having their interviews taped recorded to ensure the accuracy of their responses. The participants were assured of complete confidentiality and anonymity. The participants were instructed not to answer any question that makes them uncomfortable or that they do no wish to answer. Additionally, each participant could have at any time terminated the interview.

During the interview, I asked each participant the same series of questions. Using the semi-structured interview format (see Appendix C), I probed the participants about the content of their courses. The questions directed the conversation and covered philosophy, goals, objectives and outcomes in order to elicit information on the faculty member's orientation to and inclusion of multicultural perspectives in his/her courses. Follow-up interviews were not necessary, as the tapes were very easily transcribed.

Faculty members who consented to the 45-minute interview were asked at the conclusion of the interview to furnish copies of their syllabi, handouts, and tests. Copies of the Table of Contents from the textbooks used in each course were made. A matrix of assessment criteria was devised (see Figure 1) to determine the level of integration of multicultural education in the curriculum.

The study was conducted using the content analysis method which is based upon inferences made from the interviews and from written materials submitted by the participants (Weber, 1990). The results are reported in two sections. After introducing the three colleges, the first section is devoted to the assessment of the levels of integration of multicultural education achieved by the faculty. The evidence presented in their syllabi, textbooks, tests, handouts, and class activities was used in conjunction with the faculty interviews to determine which level of integration of multicultural education within the matrix each faculty members belonged at the time of the interviews.

The second section provides an analysis of the factors that motivate faculty to infuse their classes with multicultural perspectives. Those factors were determined to be influential forces, institutional environment and the disciplines. Influential forces were defined as personal values and the recognition of students' workforce needs. The institutional environment was influenced differently by each college in the study. Disciplinary concerns centered on the ability to integrate and general education courses.

# CHAPTER FOUR

## The Institutions

### Marantz Community College System

Marantz Community College System (MCCS) was established in the late 1960s when that state's governing body joined America's movement towards a more open educational society. The legislature created a statewide system of community colleges open to the population of a mid-Atlantic state. This system, according to its mission statement, provides for "development and extension of skills and knowledge through quality programs and services" and leadership in identifying "both the needs of individuals and the economic needs of the service areas" ([Marantz] Community College System, 1998, p.1).

MCCS started with two community colleges and the post-high school programs from several technical schools in the state (Photo Directory '98-99, 1999). Currently the system consists of more than twenty colleges, many of which are multi-campus institutions. Strategically located, the colleges serve diverse areas of the state providing both higher education opportunities and workforce training.

MCCS is governed through the leadership of a State Board for Community Colleges. Approximately five vice-chancellors who have various responsibilities assist the Chancellor, who is the chief executive officer for the system Additionally, each institution has a Local Board and a President. The similarity between the colleges' ends here as each institution has sundry organizational structures dictated by the size of institution and its student headcount.

About thirty percent of the system's approximately 75,000 full-time equivalent (FTE) students are minorities: African American (17%); Hispanic origin (4%); Asian (5%); and other minorities including Native American (3%). In the fall 1998 semester approximately 59% of students were female. Additionally, the system annually enrolls more than 70,000 students in non-credit courses ([Marantz] Statistical Profile, 1999).

The system employs about 5,000 persons, half of whom are full-time faculty. Adjunct faculty members, who are typically employed full time in local businesses during the day, teach at the local community colleges during the evening ([Marantz Community College System, 1999). Since adjunct staffing is extremely fluid, neither MCCS's central Human Resources Office nor the individual institutions' Human Resources Offices maintains statistics on adjunct faculty members.

System-wide, approximately 250 academic programs are offered in liberal arts and sciences, general education, continuing education, occupational-technical programs, and workforce training. The Associate in Applied Arts (AAA) and the Associate in Applied Science (AAS) degrees are awarded to occupational-technical degree graduates. Each college within the system provides a comprehensive curriculum typically consisting of transfer education, developmental studies occupational-technical education, and continuing education. Community workforce training services and student development services are also part of the overall program. Non-degree students may earn certificates or diplomas in certain occupational-technical programs. In addition to these terminal degree programs, transfer opportunities exist at each of the colleges in this system for those students who aspire to an undergraduate degree at a four-year institution.

Occupational objectives for persons graduating with the AAS degree in Business Management might include: Department Head, Manager of Small Business, Manager Trainee, and Office Manager. AAS degrees in Electronics afford graduates the opportunity to be employed as Laboratory Technicians, Field Service Technicians, Computer Technicians, Power and Plant Technicians or Power Distribution Technicians. Employment opportunities for graduates from the Colleges' Nursing Programs can be found in Long Term Care Facilities, Hospitals, Physician Offices and Clinics (Flatlands Community College, 1998).

In keeping with the mission of the community college system, each of the selected institution alleges to prepare students for immediate employment or to provide students with transfer opportunities to a four-year college. ([Marantz] Community College System, 1998). A profile of the three colleges is provided as background for the analysis of the faculty's integration of multiculturalism into the general curriculum.

## Upstate Community College

Upstate Community College (UCC), which is a multi-campus institution established to serve the constituents of seven counties and three cities, has two distinct campuses. One is located adjacent to a populous metropolitan city with a large urban setting. Many residents who live within the boundaries of the city proper, plus residents of the region as a whole, are employed by one of the largest tobacco manufacturing companies in the nation. The other campus is in a predominately rural setting that is close to an urban area. The major employer in this particular area is a public psychiatric facility. UCC also operates a satellite campus on a nearby military base ([Upstate] Community College, 1997).

Primarily financed by state funds, Upstate receives supplemental funding from the localities it serves. According to the Mission Statement, UCC is dedicated to the belief that all students should be given the chance to develop "their skills and knowledge along with an awareness of their roles and responsibilities within society" ([Upstate] Community College, 1997, p. 1). In the Vision Statement, the college pledges "to seek responsive and ongoing innovation in curriculum, instruction, students services and administrative support" ([Upstate] Community College, 1997, p. 1). The stated goals for Upstate Community College promise "to provide a range of academic offerings and support services designed to meet the diverse needs of the student body" ([Upstate] Community College, 1997, p. 1). The college's official student handbook does not delineate a cultural diversity or multicultural education policy.

According to the Marantz Community College System's Human Resources Department, Upstate Community College employed 66 full-time faculty members during the 1997-98 fiscal year (see table 1), with slightly more women than men represented. Approximately 47% (31) of the 68 faculty members, except for one who is 70 years plus, were in the 50–59 age group. This College's faculty is overwhelmingly Caucasian, with only 10.5% of the full time faculty belonging to minority groups.

Typically, by institutional policy, MCCS's faculty members are not tenured. The system does however subscribe to a policy of Multi-year Contacts, an arrangement that allows a faculty member, for example, to receive a three-year contract after three one-year contracts. Then faculty members, with "very good" teaching evaluations, can qualify for a five-year contract after having served under the three-year contract. Five-year contracts are renewable for as long as one remains a faculty member and are evaluated as "very good". From time to time faculty, who taught at community colleges outside of the state or four-year institutions, will bring with them a previous award of tenure, which is honored by MCCS. At UCC, all female faculty members have one-year contracts. On the other hand, seven of the twenty-eight male faculty members have tenure. The remaining twenty-one males have one-year contracts. Thus, even though the faculty is, on average, middle-aged, most have not been employed at the College for very long.

| | African American | Caucasian | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Female | 5 | 31 | 0 | 36 |
| Total | 6 | 59 | 1 | 66 |

Table 1. Distribution of 1997-98 Full-time Faculty at Upstate Community College by Gender and Ethnicity

During the academic year 1997-98, with a FTE student headcount of approximately five thousand, the college enrolled slightly less than 1% of the total population of 411,055 residents of the UCC service area ([Marantz] Community College System, 1999). The student body population at UCC, which consistently mirrors the demographics of the area, is approximately 73% Caucasian and 59% female. African Americans lead the minority complement with 22% of the total student population, of which 64% are female (see table 2).

| | African American | Asian | Caucasian | Hispanic | Native American | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Male | .36 (407) | .48 (51) | .42 (1,618) | .37 (37) | .63 (24) | .50 (2) | 2,139 |
| Female | .64 (739) | .52 (55) | .58 (2,225) | .63 (63) | .37 (14) | .50 (2) | 3,098 |
| Total | .22 (1,146) | .02 (106) | 73 (3,843) | .019 (100) | .01 (38) | .001 (4) | 1.0 (5,237) |

Table 2. Distribution of 1997-98 Full-time Equivalent Students at Upstate Community College by Gender and Ethnicity

Upstate offers approximately twenty-five programs of study, including diplomas and certificates, that prepare skilled workers, semi-professionals and technicians for immediate employment upon completion of degree requirements. In each degree program, graduates who are awarded Associate in Applied Science degrees are required to satisfactorily complete at least fifteen semester hours of specific general education courses ([Upstate] Community College, 1997).

The three occupational-technical programs chosen for this study are Business Management, Nursing, and Electronics. In 1998, approximately 70% of the students at UCC receiving AAS degrees in Electronics, Business Management, and Nursing were Caucasian. Consistent with the enrollment statistics, African Americans received approximately one-fifth of the degrees earned from each program. Hispanics, Asians, and Native Americans collectively received slightly less than 1% of degrees in these three disciplines (see table 3).

| | African American | Caucasian | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Nursing | .22 (32) | .71 (105) | .07 (10) | 147 |
| Electronics | .20 (22) | .70 (75) | .10 (11) | 108 |
| Business Management | .25 (58) | .70 (161) | 05 (12) | 231 |

Table 3. Percentage of 1997-98 Graduates at Upstate Community College by Selected Curriculum and Race

Traditionally, Nursing has been a profession dominated by females, and at UCC, the Nursing student population displays that trend. The students and faculty in the Nursing program are overwhelmingly female, although the program has a very small male complement which comprises 5% of the total Nursing students (see table 4). Conversely, men heavily populate the Electronics Program. One would assume that in a program such as Electronics the percentage would be more than the 89% actually enrolled, however, women students in Electronics, according to UCC statistics, now constitute more than 10%. Business Management, which has the largest enrollment of the three disciplines, is composed of more than two-thirds females ([Marantz] Statistical Profile, 1999).

| | Male | Female | Total |
|---|---|---|---|
| Nursing | .05 (7) | .95 (140) | 147 |
| Electronics | .89 (96) | .11 (12) | 108 |
| Business Management | .30 (69) | .70 (162) | 231 |

Table 4. Percentage of 1997-98 Graduates at Upstate Community College by Selected Curriculum and Gender

## Greenfield Community College

Greenfield Community College (GCC) was established to serve the diverse population of six rural counties and one city. A major public university located in the metropolis serves as a guaranteed-acceptance institution for graduates of Greenfield who transfer to complete the baccalaureate degree. Greenfield, like all of the institutions in the system, is funded primarily by the state, but also receives its money from tuition, grants and the legislatively-mandated annual payments of the seven service localities ([Greenfield] Community College, 1997).

According to the college catalog, the primary mission of GCC is to meet "the educational needs of its students and the region through excellence in teaching and leadership in community service"([Greenfield] Community College, 1997, p.1). One of Greenfield's goals is to "facilitate the human development of the college community" ([Greenfield] Community College, 1997, p.1). Unlike the other two community colleges studied in this project, Greenfield at least, in print, recognizes the need to be inclusive of others. This college's statement on Multicultural Diversity was adopted in 1992 and appears in the college catalog:

> [Greenfield] Community College values the multicultural diversity of its students, faculty, and staff. We are committed to creating and nurturing a campus environment, which both welcomes and empowers all individuals. We recognize cultural differences of background, experience, and national origin, and we seek to promote a genuine understanding of and appreciation for these differences. We seek as well to recognize and promote the common bonds of humanity, which cross the boundaries of cultural difference. ([Greenfield] Community College, 1997, p. 2)

According to the Marantz Community College System's Human Resources Department, Greenfield Community College employed 51 full-time faculty members during the 1997-98 fiscal year (see table 5). Twenty-seven of the 51 were women. Indicative of the "graying" faculty, approximately 45% (23) of the full-time faculty members are between the ages of 50 and 59. Only three were in the 30–39 age group. Although, the college's statement of Multicultural Diversity boasts of a commitment "to promote the common bonds of humanity, which cross the boundaries of cultural difference", the full-time faculty is predominately Caucasian. Approximately .8% of the faculty belongs to minority groups.

Marantz Community College System uses a multi-year contract policy that allows faculty members to receive a contract for varying time periods. The "one-three-five" year system is the most common. In this arrangement faculty members typically must have been at an institution for at least three years to receive a three-year contract and five years to receive a five-year contract. As GCC is a member of the MCCS, it also subscribes to this process of awarding contracts. Unlike UCC, that had no three or five-year contracts, approximately 78% (40) of the full-time faculty at GCC have five-year contracts.

| | African American | Caucasian | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Female | 2 | 24 | 1 | 27 |
| Total | 3 | 47 | 1 | 51 |

Table 5. Distribution of 1997-98 Full-time Faculty at Greenfield Community College by Gender and Ethnicity

Greenfield Community College's FTE student headcount for the academic year 1997-98 represented slightly less than 2% of the total population of 185.115 in its service area ([Marantz] Community College System, 1999). The student body at GCC, as with the faculty, is overwhelmingly Caucasian (84%). African Americans represent a very distant second (11%) and the other minority groups collectively make up the balance of 5% (see table 6).

| | African American | Asian | Caucasian | Hispanic | Native American | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Male | .31 (145) | .42 (47) | .40 (1,371) | .49 (20) | .57 (8) | .43 (15) | 1.606 |
| Female | .69 (319) | .48 (44) | .60 (2,043) | .51 (21) | .43 (6) | .57 (20) | 2,450 |
| Total | .11 (464) | .02 (91) | .84 (3.414) | .01 (41) | .003 (14) | .009 35) | 1.0 (4,059) |

Table 6. Distribution of 1997-98 Full-time Equivalent Students at Greenfield Community College by Gender and Ethnicity

Greenfield Community College offers its constituents a choice of twenty different programs of study resulting in the award of degrees, diplomas and certificates. As is the case at many community colleges in MCCS, most of the students at Greenfield receiving AAS degrees in Nursing, Business Management, and Electronics are Caucasian. For example, Caucasian students comprise a high of 88% of the students in Nursing and a low of 74% of the students in Business Management. With the exception of Nursing, African Americans received approximately one-fifth of the degrees awarded in these three curricula. Hispanics, Asians, and Native Americans are poorly represented with only nine students having received degrees in 1998 from the three occupational-technical programs (see table 7).

| | African American | Caucasian | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Nursing | .08 (11) | .88 (128) | .04 (6) | 145 |
| Electronics | .22 (22) | .77 (75) | .01 (1) | 98 |
| Business Management | .24 (29) | .74 (90) | .02 (2) | 121 |

Table 7. Percentage of 1997-98 Graduates at Greenfield Community College by Selected Curriculum and Race

Not surprisingly, males dominate Electronics at GCC (see table 8). Only 18% of the students awarded degrees in Electronics during the academic year 1997-98 were female. However, in Business Management 78% of the students receiving degrees were female. Still further, in Greenfield's largest AAS degree issued program, Nursing, 88% were females.

| | Male | Female | Total |
|---|---|---|---|
| Nursing | .12 (17) | .88 (128) | 145 |
| Electronics | .82 (80) | .18 (18) | 98 |
| Business Management | .27 (22) | .78 (94) | 121 |

Table 8. Percentage of 1997-98 Graduates at Greenfield Community College by Selected Curriculum and Gender

## Flatlands Community College

Flatlands Community College (FCC), located in the eastern most part of the state, was established to serve the educational needs of the citizens of four cities and two counties. Despite the fact that FCC is a single campus institution, it has a large student population located as it is near a military facility. The military facility serves as a satellite campus for several of the programs and contributes to the overall headcount. Additionally, FCC is surrounded by three publicly-funded and two private comprehensive institutions that serve as transfer opportunities for the students.

The college receives supplemental financial assistance from local government units, and tuition fees; however, the college's primary funding comes from the state. According to the mission statement, FCC "strives to be responsive to the educational and skills needs of the area businesses, industries, and government agencies" ([Flatlands] Community College, 1998, p.1). In its vision statement, Flatlands pledges to transform itself completely by the year 2001. According to the vision statement, "the work and learning environment will be superior, enhanced by judicious use of advanced technology, by attractive and well maintained facilities, and by a genuinely caring atmosphere that values and celebrate diversity" ([Flatlands] Community College, 1998, p. 2). Teams of faculty, students, staff and administrators determined that six areas need to be addressed in order to achieve the vision – "Technology, Student Recruitment and Retention, Management Systems, Diversity, Learning/ Work Environment and

Resource Development" ([Flatlands] Community College, 1998, p. 2). Short and long range goals apparently have been developed for each area but are not published in the handbook.

FCC presents a different approach to its organizational operation than the other two colleges studied because it, unlike the other institutions, has developed a Values Statement. In this statement, the college community subscribes to seven fundamental values:" Honesty and Integrity, Promoting Opportunity, Diversity, Customer Service, Educating the Whole Person, Nurturing Work Environment, and Demonstrated Excellence" ([Flatlands Community College, 1998, p. 2). According to the college catalog, the seven values serve as "guiding principles which determine how we identify and respond to the needs of our constituents" (1998, p.2). A brief explanation of how each value relates to the overall college environment is given for each of the statements. Of interest for this study if the following explanation concerning diversity at the college:

> As an institution of higher education, [Flatlands] appreciates and promotes an understanding of the value of diversity in ideas, people, and cultures. We must reflect this respect for the value of diversity in our curriculum, our extra-curricular activities, our employment practices, and our personal interactions. ([Flatlands] Community College, 1998, p.2)

To further demonstrate the commitment to excel in all areas of the college's operation, it concludes the explanation by stating, "we must be able to show clearly that we are achieving our desired outcomes, meeting students' needs and earning the community's support" ([Flatlands Community College, 1998, p.3).

According to the Marantz Community College System's Human Resources Department, Flatlands Community College employed 89 full-time faculty members during the 1997- 98 fiscal year (see table 9). As with the other two colleges studied, the faculty is 89% Caucasian. Evidence to illustrate the longevity of FCC's faculty is found in the type of multi-year contacts held by most of the faculty. Approximately 60% of them have five-year contracts.

| | African American | Caucasian | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Female | 5 | 40 | 1 | 46 |
| Total | 8 | 79 | 2 | 89 |

Table 9. Distribution of 1997-98 Full-time Faculty at Flatlands Community College by Gender and Ethnicity

The localities represented by Flatlands Community College have a total population of 444,717 residents. Even though only 1.3% of those residents were enrolled during the 1997- 98 academic year, FCC has the largest percentage of FTEs of the schools studied during this time period ([Marantz] Community College System, 1999). Unlike the other schools studied minorities at FCC are better represented. Approximately 37% of the FTEs at FCC are minorities. African American females are the largest minority group represented which is not surprising since females are approximately 60% of the total enrollment (see table 10).

| | African American | Asian | Caucasian | Hispanic | Native American | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Male | .33 (712) | .43 105) | .44 (1,985) | .43 (68) | .42 (18) | .27 (4) | 2.892 |
| Female | .67 (1.414) | .57(140) | .56 (2,486) | .57 (91) | .58 (25) | .73 (11) | 4.167 |
| Subtotal | .30 (2,126) | .04 245) | .63 (4,471) | .02 (159) | .007 (43) | .003 (15) | 1.0 (7059) |

Table 10. Distribution of 1997-98 Full-time Equivalent Students at Flatlands Community College by Gender and Ethnicity

Students enrolled at FCC have approximately forty programs of study resulting in degrees, diplomas, and certificates. As is the case with all of the institutions in Marantz Community College System, graduates are awarded Associate in Applied Science degrees designed to market the degree holder for immediate employment.

The dominant ethnic group among students receiving Associate in Applied Science degrees at Flatlands Community College is Caucasian (see table 11). However, the margin is not as wide as it is in Greenfield and Upstate Community Colleges. The race dominance ranges from 65% in Nursing to 58% in Electronics. African Americans surpassed the usual one-fifth of these graduates and are more than one-third (36%) of the students enrolled in Business Management. Hispanics, Native Americans, and Asians were all less than 1% of the graduates and remain consistent with the other two colleges studied.

| | African American | Caucasian | Other | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Nursing | .28 (44) | .65 (101) | .07 (11) | 156 |
| Electronics | .33 (66) | .58 (117) | .09 (19) | 202 |
| Business Management | .36 (78) | .60 (132) | .04 (9) | 219 |

Table 11. Percentage of 1997-98 Graduates at Flatlands Community College by Selected Curriculum and Race

At Flatlands Community College the Nursing Program had the smallest number of graduates (see table 12). However, of the 156 Nursing graduates, 93% (145) were women. Business Management had the highest number of graduates and approximately two-thirds of them were female. Electronics remained overwhelmingly dominated by males with only 10% being female.

| | Male | Female | Total |
|---|---|---|---|
| Nursing | .07 (11) | .93 (145) | 156 |
| Electronics | .90 (182) | .10 (20) | 202 |
| Business Management | .38 (84) | .62 (135) | 219 |

Table 12. Percentage of 1997-98 Graduates at Flatlands Community College by Selected Curriculum and Gender

Comparison and Contrast

The three institutions studied from within the Marantz Community College System exhibited many commonalties. The faculty at each college was overwhelmingly Caucasian and approximately 50% of them were in the 50-59 age group. African Americans were the largest minority group represented with only 17 out of a total of 206 faculty members from the three institutions. And, in fact, Flatlands Community College employed 8 of the 17 African American faculty members, making it the institution that employed the largest number of minority faculty during the 1997-97 school year.

Consistent with the minority representation of the faculty, the student enrollment across the three colleges is overwhelmingly Caucasian. Again, Flatlands led the minority representation from the three institutions with approximately 37 percent. Among that number, African Americans had the highest representation of minority students with the least number of minorities being Native Americans from the three institutions.

Graduates of the three occupational technical programs studied exhibited similar enrollment patterns regarding curriculum and race and gender. Caucasian women dominated the Nursing program. Electronics was most populated with Caucasian men. As was the case in the Nursing program, Business Management's largest enrollment consisted Caucasian women. That Caucasian women were the most dominant in terms of curriculum and gender and ethnicity can be explained by the fact that they enrolled in the Marantz Community College System more often than any other group.

The details of the staffing, population, organization and goals of the institutions studied paint a picture of similarity. However, in order to truly see through the statistics and organizational statements to the actual operations of these institutions, I must view them critically using a tool I modified to analyze the levels of integration of multicultural education in the curricula of the three occupational-technical degree programs.

# CHAPTER FIVE

## Integration Levels of Faculty

### Levels of Integration

The model used in this investigation is an amalgamation of two quasi-related stage models (Schuster and van Dyne, 1984; Banks, 1993). I have devised the model to determine the level of integration of multicultural education employed by the faculty in their teaching of the curriculum of three community colleges. My model consists of six levels. The levels are Exclusion Approach, Contributions Approach, Additive Approach, Transformation Approach, Decision-Making and Social Action Approach and the Integrated Approach. The levels represent the stages of increasing awareness and concern for multicultural issues that faculty members bring to their courses. They begin with "no mention of multicultural issues" and proceed to a level in which "cultural pluralism" is actively promoted by focusing on world trends and by fairly discussing other viewpoints and cultures.

My model also provides a matrix to use in analyzing instructional course content. Course content is defined as the syllabus, handouts, goals/objectives, course description, tests, and class activities that faculty members create and use to teach their courses. The three broad categories used to analyze the course content include the syllabus/ course outline with the sub-topics of course description and the course goals/objectives. The evaluation method category consists of tests and class activities. Lastly, the faculty self-report category is determined through an analysis of the faculty member's disciplinary teaching philosophy.

Using the model, I was able to determine to which level each faculty member currently belongs. The characteristics of the faculty who fall into each level are discussed based on four elements: *1) the faculty's definition of multicultural education, 2) the effect of the debate on the discipline and teaching, 3) the pressure expressed by the faculty to integrate the curriculum, and 4) their belief in the importance of achieving pluralism*. Finally, evidence from the faculty's course materials will be presented to justify "level" of placement according to my matrix.

In determining the levels of integration to which faculty belong, inferences had to be drawn. More specifically, when analyzing the syllabi, I found that faculty did not, for the most part, use such explicit words as "multicultural and diversity" in their course outlines. Rather words such as "global perspectives or international" were used to infer the same meaning.

### Level One: The Exclusion Approach

Level One, the *Exclusion Approach*, is characterized by Schuster and van Dyne's (1984), the Invisible Women stage, as a total absence of women in the curriculum. In other words, "because the core curriculum...was designed for the predominately male population returning to college on the G. I. Bill" (Schuster and van Dyne, 1984), faculty members, who were mostly male, did not notice the absence of women in the curriculum. Consequently, they made no attempt to include female perspectives or issues in their teaching.

Similarly, in my first level, faculty members approach their subject without any recognition that multicultural issues belong in the course content. Syllabi, tests and class activities are completely devoid of multicultural issues and viewpoints. The mathematics faculty most often reflected the characteristics of the Exclusion Approach.

The three mathematics instructors who teach in two of the three community colleges are all males and hold master's degrees. Since none of the math faculty interviewed was female, there is no way to determine whether gender is a factor that contributes to these disciplinarians consistently placing within the Exclusion Approach.

Definitions of Multiculturalism

Each of the math faculty members finds it quite difficult to define multiculturalism or multicultural education. One of the three, seemingly frustrated at the whole idea, stated, "the way I see it, it is exactly that. It's multi cultures, that's what it is." Another math instructor, having taught in the community college system in excess of twenty years, offered,

> I am not trying to evade the question but I wish someone would define it for me. I have no good answer for that. To me, it depends on what part of the country you're in. It never bothered me who was in my classes. We need to realize what's happening in other countries and give us a better

> chance for trade and to live with the rest of the world. This is the cheapest way to eliminate the ugly American.

The third math faculty member defined the term in this manner.

> I really don't know how to define it or if there is a definition. To my way of thinking, we should cater to the different cultures that are now represented in our society from their backgrounds and languages. Let people continue to speak another language if that's what they grew up with. Continue in the academic environment to cater to their cultural upbringing rather than try to have an American culture.

Even though, their definitions indicated that they, at least, have a limited understanding of the concept of multiculturalism, further conversation with them demonstrated that their restricted awareness translates into their teaching. The senior math faculty member stated, "I don't feel good about this. I don't think that it's good. I think that it is continuing to tear some of the fabric of our country away. And I certainly don't think that everyone should be like I am or like you are." Indicating that these feelings may not be age-biased, a junior math instructor commented, " Math does not lend itself for integration of multicultural education. There's nothing to integrate in math." As if to convince me, he continued, "Math is math. Skin color does not matter. We need to keep our priorities straight. The goal is to teach math and skin color does not matter. I don't care if I have a whole... The skin color is completely irrelevant." With a sarcastic tone, the third faculty member spouted, " ...we use the Arabic numeral system. That's cultural, isn't it?" Thus, all three men believe that their discipline must be taught, as they described it, objectively, that is, without social values.

### Debate on Multiculturalism

These exclusionists, mathematicians on the Exclusion Approach level, were asked if the national debate on multiculturalism has affected their teaching or discipline in any way. Comments from one of the mathematicians baffled me. He replied, "No, well, I suppose that in some of the courses, I let a little more talking go on because they are really trying to help each other out. They will ask the better students for help and I allow that now." His comments seem to translate multiculturalism into meaning that instructors have to be more lenient and patient with some students.

Another math instructor stated, "The whole idea of multiculturalism continues in the news. As far as math goes, I don't know of any [effect on the discipline]. As far as math goes, I have seen no influence in that direction." The third mathematician had an entirely different take on the debate and its effect on his teaching and discipline.

> I think that it has not affected my teaching. No, it has not affected my teaching, but it probably has affected my discipline because I think I've been in situations where other job interviews, where I may not have gotten the job because of the color of my skin was not what they were looking for.

Obviously, in his mind, the primary effect of multiculturalism on mathematics is related to the labor market in his discipline. This sensitivity toward employment issues surfaced again as the interviews continued.

### Pressure to Integrate

Another point of interest to me is whether or not these exclusionists ever feel pressure to integrate multicultural perspectives into their curriculum and what would drive faculty to be inclusive. Generally speaking, all three denied feeling pressure to be inclusive from any place or any person. Two of the men retreated to the concept of the objectivity of mathematics as a science when they answered. One answered, "Well, I don't feel the pressure. Anything I do here is on my own volition. I don't feel any pressure. The pressure in math is not about culture, it's about what we're suppose to teach." When asked about the driving force to integrate, he replied, "just personal awareness, I guess, of what's going on in the world." The junior math teacher stated, "No, I don't because math just doesn't lend itself." This faculty member is driven by "the truth; that's all I want is the truth. That's pretty simple. I think that's a part of this multicultural stuff."

The last math instructor, seemingly more concerned with cultural issues than his disciplinary colleagues, iterated, "Pressure only that I don't ignore it and keep an eye on it. The administration doesn't pressure us but you know it's a fact of life. Not pressure just an awareness." Faculty members are driven to become inclusive "just to make certain that we are keeping up with the world and meeting our needs." Thus, any pressure he feels is a general motivation to remain current in the social milieu.

### Pluralism

One of the faculty members recognized the need to become more global, even if he is not inclusive in his discipline. He stated,

> We must meet the needs of the community. which is changing daily. Students must interact with other cultures. In the workplace there are going to be people from different backgrounds and cultures and if they haven't had some experience in talking to one another they may not work very well on the job.

He obviously realizes how important it is for students to be knowledgeable of other cultures in order to succeed in the workforce. Yet, he still does not feel that he should do anything to help student achieve this because, according to these mathematicians, "math does not lend itself" to be inclusive. With regards to achieving cultural pluralism, this math faculty member continued, "Well, I don't think it's ever going to be achieved. I'm sort of pessimistic about it. I don't mind working towards it, but it's something that I don't see happening.

Not really answering the question concerning achieving cultural pluralism, one mathematician offered, "I don't know how much they expect to level off. I do think that the more they realize what's happening in other countries of the world, the better chance we have for trade and to live with the rest of the world." The last math instructor surprisingly agreed that "it is important to achieve the goal" of cultural pluralism. He continued, "but not... You've got to be careful. That is important. I absolutely believe that it is important but not at the expense of other things."

These three mathematicians are quite aware of the need for their students to be appreciative and knowledgeable of other cultures so that they may successfully interact with others in the workforce. However, it is their belief that these students should be taught multicultural perspectives and issues, but from sources other than math classes.

Evidence

According to my matrix, persons on the Exclusion Approach level demonstrate no concern for multicultural issues or perspectives within their teaching. The course content of these mathematics instructors, for example, reveals nothing to indicate that they translate any multicultural ideas or viewpoints to their students within their courses. Sample tests revealed that word problems do not contain Hispanic or Asian names, rather traditional Anglo Saxon names are used to designate actors in the word problems. Nothing in their course outlines, handouts, or tests indicates that they are even moving toward integrating their discipline with multicultural perspectives.

Level Two: The Contributions Approach

The *Contributions Approach*, Banks' (1993) initial level, corresponds to level two on my matrix. According to him, this level constitutes "the easiest approach to integrate the curriculum" (p. 200). This level is characterized by the insertion of ethnic holidays and personalities into the mainstream Eurocentric curriculum. Requiring few changes, faculty members merely need to discover and discuss some of the heroes of prominent cultural groups. These ethnic heroes are selected using the same criteria as that to identify heroes of the dominant culture. Traditional methods of curriculum delivery are affected minimally. Issues, values, and concepts relating to ethnic oppression and their life struggles are totally absent from all discussion. None of the faculty interviewed falls within the Contributions Approach. Three of the faculty fell within level one, the Exclusion Approach, as previously discussed. The remaining fifteen advanced beyond the Contributions Approach and will be analyzed and discussed in other levels.

### Level Three: The Additive Approach

Level three in my matrix, the *Additive Approach*, parallels Banks' (1993) level two, the Additive Approach. According to Banks, in the Additive Approach, faculty members add "content, themes, and perspective to the curriculum without changing its basic structure, purposes, and characteristics" (p. 201). Actually changing or restructuring the curriculum would be very time-consuming and would probably require the faculty member to seek additional education for themselves and to reevaluate the curriculum they teach. The latter process is one that most faculty members do not undertake readily.

My Additive Approach level is characterized by the faculty member introducing and recognizing ethnic issues, concepts, problems, etc., without restructuring the entire course or discipline. Further, faculty who fall in this level realize that cultural, racial and ethnic groups have different points of view on issues, but tend not to discuss, in coursework, the struggles of minority groups with the students.

### Definitions of Multiculturalism

Within the eighteen faculty members interviewed, five fit the characteristics of the Additive Approach level. The group consists of two economists and three psychologists. The faculty members offer definitions and explanations of multicultural education that demonstrate a comparatively higher level of sophistication than the math faculty and a more defined recognition of multiple perspectives. One of the two economics professors defined it as, "expressing points of view other that those of the typical western culture and ideas. Recognizing the contribution of other cultures as well." The other economics instructor offered, "it embodies obviously various cultures, different backgrounds, different interpretations of events. Sometimes even different realities. Not every group in society has the same experience. It's a matter of bringing different perspectives."

The psychology faculty members, within this level, exhibit more of an empathetic view in their definitions of the phrase. One psychology instructor explained that multiculturalism

> ...makes itself clear by what it isn't. It isn't the study of mainstream, European white culture. It's other things besides that. It's the contributions of people of color, contributions of women. For me, the focus has been on contributions of other Americans rather that the traditional old American culture. It should include Asians, Africans and Indians and their contributions as well.

The remaining two psychology instructors both stressed differences as the focal point in their definitions. The male instructor said, "diverse people from diverse backgrounds. It means women, and well, gender differences, people from different parts of the country. It means color differences, religious differences. It means just differences between people." The third psychology instructor explained student outcomes as a way of defining the concept.

> For me, it's to try and help students be less ethnocentric, to be more aware of not just different ethnic groups but social class differences. We talk about things like child rearing, attitudes towards women, the differences between middle class and working class people. I think I'm more interested in my students being exposed to the cultures of the groups they are likely to encounter. Syrians, Hispanics, upper middle class, lower middle class differences rather than a global view of all sorts of cultures.

As with the mathematics faculty members, each instructor had at least been exposed to the terminology. Further conversations with these faculty members revealed that some of them were quite selective in the materials they introduced to the students. A psychology instructor disclosed, "I think it is important to acknowledge only that which is useful as informative in cultures other than our own." Statements of this nature reinforce my criterion that faculty members on the Additive Approach level tend not to discuss the oppression of other cultures with their students.

### Debate on Multiculturalism

Any effect from the debate about multiculturalism on the disciplinary teaching philosophies with this group of instructors appears to be varied and somewhat related to the discipline itself. Both economics instructors gave very little credit to discussion about multiculturalism having had an effect on their teaching philosophy. Reminiscent of the objectivity stance of the mathematicians, one responded, "Very little in economics. We teach what is called positive economics, basically factual reports." The other replied,

> Probably not the debate on multiculturalism so much as the fact that I chaired the College's multicultural task force for two years. And having the opportunity to work with a lot of other people in very very frank discussions was just a wonderful eye-opener for me. I learned so many things. That probably more than anything else kind of changed my approach to the world.

For the first time, faculty members recognized the social debate is modifying their discipline. The psychology faculty members all reported being affected professionally by the debate. The consequence varies greatly though. The senior psychologist asserted, "Yeah, because it is a debate about ideas and every time there's a debate about ideas or whether it is about women or African Americans...all of it affects my discipline because I am a scientist." The male psychology instructor, though not as positive as his female colleagues, said, "Well, I suppose it has made me and more people, more aware. As a society, we've moved from one sort of way of thinking to being aware that there are differences between people." Quite enthusiastically, the junior psychology faculty member stated,

> ...As far as my own teaching goes, probably so. I show a video on caring for infants of different cultures. I have a video about children...at age ten...surviving on their own. Those are the things I've added over the last

> five years. Not as much as it could be because of time. My course is training people for nursing, food services, physical therapy, etc. I think for them a little awareness that people come from different backgrounds with different attitudes about dating, marriage, etc. [is warranted]. How much? Oh, I don't know; 10% of the course, maybe.

It is obvious that this instructor realizes that there are cultural differences relating to social issues and is willing to share some of it with her class. However, if her class were restructured she would not have to make isolated reference to just one portion of her class that is devoted to these issues. Restructuring for multicultural content would mean that multicultural perspectives are present throughout her course.

Pressure to Integrate

This group of five faculty members split in their responses to whether they felt pressure from any source to be inclusive. Two of these instructors identified the locus of pressure coming from students although for one, the force was more overt than for the other. The junior flatly stated, "The pressure is from the students. Some of the things we talk about don't make as much sense to people who come from different backgrounds." The push for the second faculty member is less direct. "It's just that I want to do it. I want to do it in fairness to the students."

The remaining three felt no pressure from sources, but they all referred to inner feelings that drive them to include multicultural issues and perspective in their disciplines. One could attribute these feelings as "values' of fairness and openness. Perhaps those persons who elect a career in the helping profession do so because they already have a value system conducive to inclusiveness. They add new justifications, "just for myself. It's only me, nobody has said do it" According to another, "the only successful way to do it is for the faculty member to want to do it themselves." For one psychology instructor, his own ethnicity has been a driving force.

> I think a little introspection and soul searching. I come from a nationality that people have made fun of and made jokes about... and I guess that has influenced me personally. There is something within that makes me want to do it. It is a much stronger force than someone putting pressure on you.

Pluralism

In discussing the importance of achieving cultural pluralism, several faculty members voiced its significance again as an outcome and connected it specifically to the concept of cultural toleration. An economics faculty member rationalized pluralism as a way

> To avoid some of the mistakes we made in the past. When you can perceive something through the eyes of someone else, you tend to have more empathy and less hostility towards them... I think when you relate to someone's country, it makes the students more accepting and feel more a part of what's going on.

The other economics faculty member summarized, "culture is a fact of life…We have so much contact with other cultures that we can't ignore them. We can't pretend they don't exist."

Although still heavily concerned with the outcome of toleration, the junior psychology instructor reflected that

> The world seems to be getting smaller. We don't live with people just like ourselves anymore. I just want the life skill…not to take offense when people say things because you come from a different perspective. That's a hard concept because we've been taught to always place a value…We need to see the difference before applying a judgement.

The psychologists tended to demonstrate more sophistication in their understanding of pluralistic concepts, but nonetheless also focused on toleration as an outcome. One psychology instructor felt that "it makes us more accepting and gives us a broader background of understanding the human behavior of people." And another psychologist stated,

> Oh, my. I think it is important to achieve it. I don't know how long it will take…We can't live in a nest of friction and hostility and xenophobia, where we are afraid of anybody different from ourselves. I really think the whole notion of "Think globally – Act locally" is an important one.

These five instructors have contemplated the concepts of multiculturalism and have recognized the need to acknowledge others who are dissimilar. As "Additives", they have added multicultural events, concepts, perspectives, and issues into their courses. Yet I found little in the syllabi, course descriptions, tests or class activities to indicate any restructuring has taken place.

Evidence

Even though economics instructors may be less inclined to openly demonstrate inclusiveness in their courses, evidence can be found to support their placement as additives. Handouts display graphs and charts using international names rather than merely domestic ones to depict different economic and banking principles. Additionally, sample situational problems on wage discrimination are not just centered on the problems in this nation. Rather, references to global or multicultural concepts are sometimes found on the course syllabi.

Couched in the junior psychology instructor's handouts is an assignment that calls for reflection of family characteristics. Students are asked to denote their ethnicity and to "list values, beliefs, attitudes, holidays, foods, religion, etc." that support that ethnic group. Additionally, detailed perusal of her tests display names such as Maya, Rosita, Juan, and Kayla, as well as Nancy, Greg and Jenny.

The same textbook is used by two of the psychology instructors with the third text being very similar. Using the table of contents in these texts some references to multicultural education can be discerned from chapters on bilingualism, Creole language, and cross-cultural child rearing. Pictures, names and situational illustrations appear inclusive. One psychologist commented, "There's probably some place in every chapter where we talk about differences."

However, there is no mention of cultural differences or international or global perspectives and concepts visible on either syllabus. Their lack of significant attention to these issues within at least the written documentation for their courses is the primary reason that these instructors fall into the additive level. According to Banks (1993), "The Additive Approach can be the first phase in a more radical curriculum reform effort designed to restructure the total curriculum and to integrate it with ethnic content, perspectives, and frames of references" (p. 201).

This unique group of instructors has exhibited their awareness of and appreciation for other cultures through their interviews and meager references on the course content. They possess the knowledge to move upward to the next level as soon as they undertake the task of restructuring their courses.

### Level Four: The Transformation Approach

Level four on my matrix, the *Transformation Approach*, mirrors Banks' (1993) third level of the same name. Banks claims that this level "changes the basic assumptions of the curriculum and enables students to view concepts, issues, themes and problems from several ethnic perspectives and points of view" (p. 203). In this level one realizes that it is neither possible nor desirable for every ethnic group to be considered in every issue or problem, plus the Eurocentric perspective is still present but assumes less of a dominant role than in earlier levels.

In the Transformation Approach level, it is incumbent upon the faculty member to include perspectives that acquaint students with different ethnic groups and how they were influential to the shaping of the United States. Additionally, if the curriculum has been transformed, the syllabi, tests, objectives, etc. should reflect this more inclusive philosophy.

Of the eighteen persons interviewed slightly over half (10) qualify to be included on the Transformation Approach level. Some faculty from all three schools and both genders are represented in the group. The group consists of six English, two history, and two sociology faculty members. Since the faculty members in this group represent several disciplines within the humanities and social sciences, I chose to analyze their interviews and course content across disciplinary lines and to screen in common patterns that I believe transcend disciplines rather than focus on characteristics that may be particular to one discipline.

## Definitions of Multiculturalism

Within these three disciplines represented in this level, the respondents' definitions of multicultural education seemed to form some distinct patterns. Perhaps not surprising, given the nature of these disciplines, one of the similarities between the historical, sociological, and literary scholars in this group is the presence of "canon busters". Academicians, students, or political pundits who object to use of the traditional canon in any discipline are considered to be canon busters (Shaw, 1994).

One-half (5) of the instructors in the Transformation Approach advocate the abolishment of the traditional canon whether it is literary, sociological or historical. "From my perspective as an English teacher, it would mean expanding the canon so that we don't teach DEAD WHITE MEN and so that students become exposed to Asian writers, African American writers, Native American writers, etc." A criterion for the Transformation Approach level is that concepts, issues and problems must be discussed with an eye toward how those contributions helped to shape this nation. Conversely, the traditional historical canon is that body of information that is geared to the nation-building contributions made by Eurocentric white males.

Concurring with the inclusion of more that the traditional contributions of Eurocentric white males and in tune with actually integrating different concepts and perspectives into his discipline, one history instructor offered,

> From the history side, the shift has been toward a decent amount of treatment for ethnic and racial minorities. So multiculturalism…is a presentation of a wide range of materials on the racial and ethnic groups that make up the United States today. In the textbooks, at least, there is a presentation of an accurate coverage of groups. By that I mean, something is devoted to each group.

The other history faculty member looked at expanding the traditional canon in a very different manner from most instructors. He defined multicultural education very narrowly, partly, as we will discuss shortly, because he is narrowly focused on Jazz content. He stated, "More emphasis on Black History. More emphasis on Women's History. In my case it would be the introduction of Jazz into the curriculum, which I intend to do. The book already does this, I think, in a very good way". This Transformer is in danger of being considered Afrocentric, a perspective that some multiculturalists see as detrimental to the expansion of the canon as an Eurocentric perspective.

Interestingly enough, the abolition of the canon has supporters in every discipline. Sociologists, who by definition of the discipline study human behavior, also feel the need to be inclusive and to expand perspectives beyond the traditional canon. One of the sociologists in the Transformation Approach defined multicultural education as

> ...teaching not just dominant values of one culture but incorporating within one nation.. We incorporate all genders, all cultures, religions, ethnic groups...as a part of the contribution to the makeup of our society. It fits perfectly with sociology and is what sociologists have done from the beginning. Students need to learn that the world is a much smaller place and that the influences of other cultures impact our nation, as well as, we impact theirs.

Among this group of Transformers were faculty members who displayed a second characteristic. Specifically, several instructors are committed merely to ensuring that students were aware that other cultures exist apparently so that these students could better understand contributions made by diverse cultures to this society. The only English instructor from Upstate Community College defined multicultural education from a narrow perspective..."as developing an awareness that goes beyond your neighborhood. It involves race, class, and ethnic groups. In other words, looking outside your neighborhood." In the Transformation Approach, faculty members focus on helping students to understand each ethnic group and its role in the shaping of this nation. A faculty member from Greenfield commented:

> I think it's very complex. We really don't understand much about the different groups in society... It seems that the only way to get along is to understand one another – truly understand – and not just make everything conform to one group.

Admitting that, "I don't quite know what it [multiculturalism] is" another faculty member continued, "certainly the more one knows about other cultures, the greater the chance is that one will understand and at least see common ground [so that] tensions might be lessened."

Perhaps the patterns prevalent in this group can best be characterized by one of the definitions offered by one of the Transformers. She defined multiculturalism "as education that includes cultures other than western and European cultures and their ways—through specific courses focused on other cultures and through the infusion of or inclusion of other perspectives and materials."

These definitions of multicultural education demonstrate the characteristics of the Transformation Approach. Identifying common themes across the disciplines illustrates that instructors in each of the three disciplines are not satisfied to teach the dominant culture perspective only. They have begun to rethink their respective curriculum. Each is clearly on track to present their students with basic curricular goals, contents and issues structured in such a way to include perspectives from different cultural and ethnic groups.

### Debate on Multiculturalism

The nature of any debate dictates that participants occupy different points of view on a continuum of discussion. The ten faculty members on this level were asked if the national debate on multiculturalism has affected their teaching or discipline in any way. The most common response was affirmative. Important to this issue is how the specific faculty members are affected. The English faculty members unanimously agree that the debate has affected both their teaching and discipline in some respects. One of these English instructors offered,

> [It] has definitely affected my discipline and my teaching too. Because of the prominence of the debate [on multiculturalism] the materials are available. The anthology that we use in [course name] makes a conscious effort to be inclusive. So I am able to expose students to a range of culture and authors that wasn't there prior to this interest in multicultural education.

Another English instructor commented that, "It has certainly affected my teaching within the last five years. I was presenting work that was in the text which hadn't been written with a multicultural slant at all. So now I supplement what I do by seeking other sources that are more inclusive. It has changed a lot." The three remaining English instructors concur that the discipline has been greatly affected by multiculturalism. One of them remembers what she was taught and tries to explain to her students that in that point of time "the literature was pretty much restricted to not a lot of women, not a lot of African Americans, Native Americans or anybody else. Basically all American literature at that time was dead white men."

Overwhelmingly, English faculty expressed that the discipline has necessarily been affected by information that is included in the textbooks. Newer texts and anthologies have provided a vehicle for concerned instructors to introduce students, and faculty alike, to the many different voices in literature. One English instructor explained,

> Certainly our discipline because of having to teach things like World Literature. This is replacing the Classics, I think. In all of the courses I teach, I look at my preparation, how I teach, how I go about choosing textbooks has changed. I don't use the same reader I did ten years ago—I look for different voices. I have had to have a whole different education to do this.

The influence of textbooks is not limited exclusively to the English faculty. According to one historian who responded excitedly when asked about the national debate, "Yeah, yeah, yeah. I'm more aware of it. At first I was negative and then I studied Jazz. I listened to the Blues." He has been influenced from reading and studying about the African American contribution to the music field. Continuing he stated, "I just want to show the students that Jazz is the Black contribution to American history. A lot of these kids don't know this. Jazz is the most integrated of all media in the world. If you want to talk about integration, talk about Jazz."

Three of the ten instructors did not appear to be affected by the debate. The history instructor vacillated with his response, "No it hasn't, but it most certainly will." The sociology instructors again expressed no change in what they do simply because "sociology of all the disciplines is the one that kind of approaches this directly—head on." One sociology instructor was quite direct in her response, "Myself personally, not so much simply because I have been doing it all along anyway." The other sociology instructor rather emphatically stated, "Not a bit. In fact, I go out of my way to treat my students in such an equal way that you may find this peculiar, but I don't care to know the names.... To place judgement on people based on preconceived notions of our differences is something I try to avoid." From these statements he appears to be more advanced than others on this level. In actuality, he refuses to recognize differences in cultures. "There is just too much emphasis on differences. I try to find the common ground and work from there." At one point in the interview, he stated, "I don't think I made myself clear. I don't want to push the issue [of differences]."

Without knowing more about his philosophy, I am skeptical about this sociologist's common ground perspective that avoids differences in peoples. He professes to be inclusive due to the nature of the discipline. Based on my understanding, the nature of this particular discipline requires recognition of different groups, their cultural concepts, and their social patterns. To move beyond the Transformation Approach level, one must first learn to recognize, appreciate, and develop an understanding of the differences in cultures.

Nevertheless, the majority of faculty members on this level readily admit to being influenced by the debate on multiculturalism. The English, and at least one history, faculty members attribute this influence to the abundant increase in textbooks, anthologies and supplementary handbooks. In accordance with the criteria for being a Transformer, students must be presented with a balanced view of the development of our society in the arts, music, history, etc.

Pressure to Integrate

These ten faculty members express their positive concern for multicultural education. Some of them have been influenced by either the national or disciplinary debate on the subject, while others feel that the orientation of their discipline lends itself to teaching about multicultural issues naturally. When asked if they felt pressured to integrate their courses, their responses ranged from, "No pressure at all" to "Personally, I feel it's an opportunity that I am glad for."

Six instructors from two different institutions, like the faculty members in the Additive Approach, profess to having a "force" within that drives them to be more inclusive. They feel that they have not been subject to external pressure, rather they believe that the transformation comes from within. "Just the faculty member him/her self. They must take the initiative" were the words of one of these instructors. Clearly, these faculty members are referring as much to their personal values as those gained from their disciplines. "You have to feel it in order to make your students feel it."

A second group of the Transformation faculty is all employed at Greenfield Community College. These four faculty members indicated that they do not sense bureaucratic or social pressure to integrate the curriculum, but find their institution maintains an atmosphere that promotes the multicultural perspectives and issues. This positive supportive attitude from the administration indirectly urges them to be more inclusive. One indicated that the atmosphere emanates from the college's top administrator.

> I'm not sure pressure is the right word. I think I feel expectations but I've never felt someone even suggesting that I would be in trouble if I didn't. There's just encouragement but that's not pressure. You know I think it's more of a mood than anything else. The President's enthusiasm is kind of infectious and we all sort of got swept up in the multicultural theme not because we were directed but because it seemed to make sense, something whose time had come. I never felt any pressure.

To explain what drives him and other faculty members to be inclusive he continued, "I would hope a sense of fairness. A sense of the right thing to do. I can only speak for this faculty and I know it pretty well. I think a sense of fairness if nothing else would define it for this faculty." Others Transformers from this institution, regardless of discipline, voiced the same sense of a supportive environment for multicultural issues at Greenfield.

Thus, the Transformers appear to decide for themselves that this approach is the right way to teach. None of them feel that they have been pressured into adopting a set of values to which they do not adhere. However, one group feels supported, not coerced, within their institution in approaching its teaching discipline this way.

### Pluralism

Since within the Transformation Approach, faculty present the stories of different ethnic and cultural groups, but do not provide students with the opportunity to evaluate or take social action, the question of achieving cultural pluralism may well represent a social state beyond this level. Equality of all voices in the curriculum is not feasible according to the teaching philosophy at this level. Without the conviction that an entirely new approach to society is essential for cultural pluralism, these faculty members add information with little purpose, beyond that of, tolerance. Hence, decisions often need to be made about which groups to include and which to exclude. Although pluralism is important to one of the history instructors, he confessed that, "we run into time constraints. With our time constraints it is impossible to do it. We are focused on getting them out and getting the educated while they are here. Ours is constrained by time."

One of the sociology instructors neither affirmed nor negated the potential achievement of cultural pluralism. Rather he believes that inequality is a normative state for our country, and that the real culprit is economic, not political. Pluralism– "that's a frame of mind. And if everyone had it we wouldn't be having this discussion. So long as we have capitalism we will not ever have equality. There is always going to be a rich nation and a poor nation and of course the name of the game is capitalism."

More typical were the responses received from other Transformation faculty. Many of them felt it important to achieve equal representation of the cultures. However, their rationale for moving toward pluralism appears to have as a goal, cultural relativity, i.e., and an appreciation of differences, not eventual change. The underlying attitude of these faculty members appears to uphold the liberal education as a personal enrichment rather than a social change mechanism. One English teacher passionately hinted that teaching at the transformation level might lead to change eventually.

> Absolutely, that's the only way we as a society are going to work for justice or world peace. Look around the world, the majority of the world's problems is because we don't have understanding and tolerance of other cultures. The people who look different, who speak different languages; for some reason we still have this terror or fear of difference.

However, the faculty members do not possess an explicit goal to effect social change; change in their estimation appears to result purely from understanding. "I don't see how we can survive a culture without appreciating others as well." In the same vein, another believes that "It is important to achieve that goal just for the well-being of the world and humanity and the broadening and enriching of human beings on an individual level. It has to be done; just the experience of learning about other people and other cultures is valuable."

A parallel perspective of the personal enrichment attitude, voiced by a history instructor, argues a different personal end for teaching multiculturalism.

Pluralism

> [is] going to be more important in the 21st century. We have already seen an increased interest in the business community. It 's really going to be important for the transfer student but even more so for those in Business Management and Computer Information Systems to have to deal with this.

This history instructor was not alone in his assessment regarding the implications of our workforce if there is not a more sincere effort worldwide to understand and appreciate other cultures. At least two other faculty members from this group expressed concern. When stating her opinion on the necessity of multicultural education, a sociology instructor said,

> Oh yes, absolutely, but not only in minority groups. Multicultural education is an issue across the country and we must deal with it as such... I think it's a must. If you are talking about preparedness for students going into the next century, it's an absolute must. In terms of looking at occupations, in the world of business you will find that in a lot of institutions have added [Japanese, Russian, German] in the language department... You will find that in so much of the world trade market they speak languages other than English.

This group of Transformers was versatile in its responses to the questions. The responses proved that they recognized the need and have restructured their curriculum to include multicultural perspectives and concept. However, they stop short of providing any insight on the decision making and social change which is needed to advance to the next level.

Evidence

The mere profession of the need to change, however, is not enough for inclusion in this level. An essential characteristic of this level is evidence of course content revision. Syllabi should reflect an integration of new perspectives into the presentation of the discipline within the printed description, goals, and objectives of the courses.

On the syllabus of one of the history instructors, the course description reads, "...is designed to explore all the major historical events that shaped our present society." In accordance with my matrix, the course description and objectives should focus on "expanding the understanding of how ethnic groups were influential in shaping the nation from several vantage points." To demonstrate his correct placement on this level, the history instructor's listed the following objectives: "Describe the rise of slavery as a major sectional issue in American politics by bringing in the role of the abolitionists", and "Discuss the contributions that Blacks, women and Native Americans made in American History."

The second history professor obviously engages students in exploring and thinking about a variety of cultural groups and events. His test questions indicate that students were assigned at least one article that focused on 17th century South Carolina demographics, highlighting its Black majority. In addition, a discussion of Indian cultures was manifest in his content. His essay questions push students to compare and contrast ethnic groups and show how they influenced the United States society as outlined in the Transformation Approach level.

On practice chapter tests questions distributed by the sociology instructor, I found that, in addition to the traditional economic and sociological questions, approximately 20% of the questions were related to minority or cultural issues. According to a test question this instructor obviously discussed the customs and mores of the Spanish and their relationship with Native Americans. His questions also indicate that discussion regarding the refinement of Park and Burgess's theory of ethnic succession was required. In order for students to answer these specific types of questions, faculty members must have exposed them previously to materials related to different ethnic groups and their cultures.

All of the six English faculty members teach some type of freshman composition class and use the same overarching method of teaching. Students are assigned reading from a variety of sources, such as anthologies, readers, textbooks, handouts, etc. The students are then instructed to write an essay or paragraph reacting to what has been read. Key here is the type and content of the material read. Overwhelmingly, these six faculty members infused the traditional Eurocentric canon with many different voices. Readings and writing assignments were from authors such as, Piri Thomas, Langston Hughes, Maxine Hong Kingston, Paulo Freire and Amy Tan, as well as, Rachel Carson, Ellen Goodman, Stephen King, and Ernest Hemingway.

The majority of group activities, handouts, and tests used by these instructors have drastically changed over the last five years in favor of being more inclusive of multicultural issues and perspectives. For some, being more inclusive came easy because the textbooks have changed. A male faculty member commented, "In our [course name] class, we use [text title] by [author]. I've watched it evolve over the years. It is so much more diverse now. It was very Western when I came and now it runs the gamut of multiculturalism."

Literature courses, taught by some of the six English professors, allow them great latitude to integrate the discipline. One such instructor commented,

> In American Literature, I can certainly see all of the reasons to recognize all of the voices that constitute American Literature, which is more or less being done in the texts—[Langston] Hughes, [Gwendolyn] Brooks, and people like N. Scott Momaday, who is of Native American ancestry. On the other hand, it seems to me that you would also like to acknowledge the literature that did all of the shaping of American Literature, so I include the slave narratives, Phillis Wheatley , etc.

For other faculty members, being inclusive has not come easily. While all six of these faculty members appear to be responding to the criteria for the Transformation Approach, some have not done the requisite research to appreciate or understand fully the range of available cultural materials. One of them even confessed to being a little apprehensive about presenting material with which he was not very familiar. "I don't [discuss] even though the texts have them, Native American myths. I don't think I know enough about Native American culture to assign a myth and then say that this tell us so and so about

Native American culture. So I'm a little timid about that". This faculty member has yet to do all that he can do to ensure an integrated multicultural course.

Integrating the courses has created a need for faculty to retrain themselves in some respects as well. However, the task is daunting for some. A primary issue that transformative faculty deal with is deciding what to include and what not to include. An English faculty member stated,

> It became an almost insurmountable problem with so many different backgrounds to cover. I spent more time just digging and searching and just trying to find anything that would bring in everyone. I was caught in a trap because I couldn't bring in something about the Japanese without remembering the Swedish. If I didn't include everyone the unfairness of it was so glaring that I was really self-conscious about it... Now I supplement much of what I do by seeking other sources that are more inclusive.

Analyses of the ten faculty members place them on the Transformation Approach level on my matrix. First, evidence is present to show that they have taken the time to revise the formerly narrow focus of the teaching of their disciplines. Secondly, they present students with the opportunity to view concepts, issues, and problems of the different ethnic groups who helped to shape and develop our nation's culture. Consequently, students will, it is assumed, better understand the nature, development and complexity of the United States society.

### Level Five: The Decision-Making and Social Action Approach

My fifth level, *Decision-Making and Social Action Approach*, is characterized by first employing all the elements of the Transformation Approach level. Additionally, this level requires students to be taught the skills to identify, compare, and analyze social and ethnic problems. Instructors must teach students how to make decisions relating to ethnic situations and what action is appropriate to resolve the situation. According to Banks (1993), a major goal of his similar fourth and final level, the Social Action Approach, is "to educate students for social criticism and social change and to teach them decision making skills" (p. 205).

During the interviews, I asked each of the eighteen faculty members if critical thinking and problem solving skills were among the goals/objectives of their courses. And if so, I further asked if they ever use situational ethnic problems or analyze ethnic readings to impart these skills. Generally speaking, English instructors responded affirmatively; however, their additional comments are reflective of their intent and purpose. One instructor, typical of the rest, commented, "Oh yeah. Well, the student can read an essay and reflect upon it and that's critical thinking. For example: King's *Letter from Birmingham*, etc. Those essays get into differences but that's not my primary emphasis." To be classified on level five, the primary emphasis must be on employing critical thinking and problem solving to address social issues. The above statement falls short of my criterion that instructors at this level focus on teaching students how to analyze and solve problems. None of the six English instructors fit into this category.

As might be expected, the responses from the math faculty ranged from, "That doesn't really seem to pertain to math and I would not think of bringing situational problem in a math class", to "Oh Yes. That's one of our objectives. If they could only read, it would be a lot easier to build on it". Their answers were consistent with their belief that multicultural issues have no place in math. Consequently, none of the math faculty could be placed on this advanced level.

The social science faculty members reacted in one of two ways. Some excused their omission of a focus on social analysis and action by explaining the shortcomings of the students--"I'm finding that my people have enough trouble just absorbing basic facts" --or the discipline--For sociology maybe, but I can't think of a psychology example." Others, although holding the value, employ educational materials that either does not suit the intent of this level--"Yes, it is a goal. But I don't think I use those types of examples", --or that relate to the issues but are not used deliberately--"Yes, I might use some but I don't do it consciously, if I do". As with the English and math faculty, none of the social sciences instructors qualifies for the Decision-Making and Social Action Approach.

## Level Six: The Integrated Approach

*The Integrated Approach*, my sixth and final level mirrors Schuster and van Dyne (1984) sixth stage, the Transformed Curriculum. Their stage calls for a curriculum "that offers an inclusive vision of all human experiences". (p. 427) regardless of gender.

My Integrated Approach level promotes cultural pluralism in the curriculum by focusing on world trends, developments, issues and by accepting views and cultures other than our own. In this level, course objectives and descriptions center on ways to encourage pluralism and the understanding of the beliefs, experiences, attitudes, and values of other cultures. Lastly, the emphasis assures that each group's (ethnic, religious, or cultural) experiences have equitable representation and voice in a democratic environment.

Several of the instructors from Greenfield and Flatlands Community Colleges boast that they have received grants and participated in workshops, seminars, etc., for multicultural issues. Two faculty members even report that they served on committees to foster diversity at their institutions. The majority of the instructors strongly supports the ideal of cultural pluralism within the curriculum and at the institutions but admit that the task is a very difficult one. Comments such as, "Yes, I feel that it is important to achieve that goal just for the well being of the world and humanity. Just the enriching experience of learning about other people and other cultures is valuable", indicate that some faculty members are interested in achieving the ideal.

One exception, perhaps not surprising, was a math faculty who stated, "Well, I don't think it's ever going to be achieved. It's something that I don't see happening. I don't see that we are ever going to get this managed." His disciplinary colleague does not agree entirely, though is obviously troubled by a previous occurrence.

> It's important to achieve that goal. But not... You've gotta be careful. I absolutely believe that it is important but not at the expense of other things. You have to be very careful when you say equally represented. It does not matter what your qualifications are; all that matters is that we are equally represented. Even if you are not quite as qualified and that's just wrong. It's just wrong. I am not a racist–absolutely not. I believe 100% that the best qualified should get the job. It doesn't matter what the skin color is. I don't even see skin color.

Clearly, his concerns with employment issues override curricular issues and the ultimate goal of cultural pluralism.

None of the faculty approaches this ideal goal of pluralism. No one indicated that his/her college, or even the discipline, was anywhere near achieving cultural pluralism. Such an achievement in the discipline would require change beginning with the Marantz Community College System down to a change in the student body. The change process has begun for some faculty member but the great majority has done nothing to facilitate any change. Consequently none of the faculty I interviewed placed within my Integrated Approach level.

## Summary

Eighteen faculty members from three colleges in the Marantz Community College System agreed to be interviewed concerning multicultural education. The colleges were Upstate Community College, Greenfield Community College and Flatlands Community College. All the faculty members teach students who are enrolled in the Nursing, Business Management, or Electronics programs. Upon graduation these students receive the AAS degrees and are immediately confronted with a multicultural workforce. The question then is to what degree students are prepared to meet the new challenges of the world of work. My study investigated and analyzed the course content and philosophy of teaching of the eighteen faculty members to determine what level of integration of multicultural education each has attained within their teaching assignments.

All, but one of the participating faculty, are Caucasian. I was able to interview only one minority faculty member, an African American. This minority faculty member demonstrated the same characteristics as others of the Transformation Approach, placing her in the same category as her disciplinary colleagues. As noted in Chapter One, having access to only one minority does not allow me to determine if ethnicity is a factor in the integration of multicultural education in the curriculum. Therefore ethnicity of the faculty, as it relates to the level on integration of multicultural education into the curriculum, needs to be explored further. Additionally, degrees held, longevity in the classroom at their respective institutions, and faculty rank add depth to the description of the faculty members, but none of these factors proved to be important to the degree of integration of multicultural education into their course work.

In the analyses of the interviews and course content. I found that of the eighteen faculty members interviewed, three fell within the *Exclusion Approach* level. Course contents (syllabi, tests, class activities, etc.) are devoid of multicultural issues and viewpoints. Of particular interest is that the three faculty members are from two schools, and they all teach mathematics. Each math teacher was aware of the national debate to be more inclusive but feels that these issues, concepts, and perspectives have no relevance to the study and application of the discipline of mathematics.

The Contributions Approach, level two on my matrix, is characterized by faculty members simply inserting ethnic heroes and holidays into the courses without discussing any issues, values or concepts related to the ethnic group and its struggles. After carefully analyzing their course content, I found none of the remaining instructors to fit this category. The remaining fifteen all had advanced beyond the Contributions Approach level.

Level three, the Additive Approach, permits faculty members to add perspectives, issues, and viewpoints of non-majority people into the curriculum without actually changing the basic outline of the course. At this stage, ethnic ideas and concepts are introduced and discussed without undertaking the time-consuming task of restructuring the course or discipline. I found five of the faculty members to use the Additive Approach. The group included two economics and three psychology instructors.

This group of instructors is quite vocal in expressing the viewpoints and perspectives of multiculturalism during their interviews. They agree that the multicultural debate has had some positive influence on their teaching philosophy and has made them more aware of other ethnic issues. Additionally, they feel that it is necessary to achieve cultural pluralism because the world appears metaphorically, to be getting smaller and there is a need to be more understanding and appreciative of other cultures. Although they professed these views and perspectives during the interviews, it was very difficult to find references to these new ideals in any of their course content.

I searched the course content of these faculty members several times in order to find documentation to support what they verbalized. I found that one instructor required a one page essay at the end of each chapter that detailed a life experience of the students as it related to the chapter's focus. This exercise enables the students to discuss other cultures. Several references in handouts and diagrams from the economics faculty were from international and global ports. Non-traditional names were used by some in their tests and handouts. This group of faculty members is working towards integrating their courses but had not taken the time or initiative to restructure their courses on paper. Thus, they fell within the Additive Approach level.

The remaining ten faculty members have earned places within the Transformation Approach level. This group consists of six English, two history and two sociology faculty members. They hail from all three colleges and are of both genders. Neither institutional affiliation nor gender appears to be a pivotal factor in realizing the need for curricular transformation. Similar to the faculty on the Additive Approach level, the Transformers expressed their belief in inclusiveness during the interviews. However, unlike those in the Additive Approach level, their course work provided evidence of some restructuring.

The ten faculty members on this level not only present materials and viewpoints that acquaint student with different ethnic groups, but also discuss how they helped to shape this nation. Evidence to support their claim of inclusion is found throughout the course content. The descriptions, goals, syllabi, and tests exhibit enhanced courses that provide multicultural perspectives. Thus these ten faculty members fall within the Transformation Approach level.

Level five, Decision-Making and Social Action Approach, and level six, the Integrated Approach, requires considerably more advanced integration of multiculturalism than was displayed by any of the faculty members I interviewed. None of the eighteen participants in this study demonstrated attainment of the required criteria to be placed in either level five or level six.

An interesting aspect of my findings centered on the reasons why most of the instructors have begun to be more inclusive. Some of those who have begun to adopt new patterns explain that they were driven by a "force" within themselves to "do the right thing" and to respond to the changing face of our society. Still other some faculty members--even though they received no apparent external pressure—were moved to be more inclusive because their institutional environment encouraged multicultural perspectives. In conclusion, I found no different patterns of curricular integration of multicultural issues among or between the faculty who varied by ethnicity, longevity, institutional affiliation, and gender. Rather, their disciplines and a "force" from within themselves influence faculty members to integrate their curriculum with multicultural perspectives. Finally, these influences may be supported by positive atmosphere within their institutions.

# CHAPTER SIX

## Motivational Factors

The levels of integration of multicultural education in the curricula as presented by the individual teachers are influenced by an amalgamation of three variables. These motivational factors are: the interaction among influential forces that press faculty members to be inclusive, the institutional commitment that provides a supportive environment to faculty members to be more inclusive of multicultural perspectives in their teaching, and the content of the disciplines.

### The Influential Forces

Generally speaking faculty members made it very clear that they did not feel any pressure from the administration of their respective colleges or from the state-wide system's management. During the interviews however, several faculty members attributed their attempts to be inclusive of multicultural perspectives to either a personal value system or to their being sensitive to the needs of students. Although both of these influences emanate from within the individual, we can discern the possible motivation creating this perspective.

This internal value-based force can be likened to a moral compass that locks the individual's internal values on target. Internal values are abstract ideas, positive or negative, that represents a person's belief about modes of conduct or behavior (Bennett, 1995). Several of the faculty members were driven to include multicultural perspectives by their internal values, often based on life's experiences and an innate moral sense of fairness. Although most of this group did not pinpoint the stimulus of this value-set, one psychology instructor suggested his own background is the impetus for inclusive teaching.

> I come from a nationality that people have made fun of and made jokes about…and I guess that has influenced me personally. There is something within that makes me want to do it. It is a much stronger force than someone putting pressure on you.

Similar, but less definitive comments were offered from other faculty members from different disciplines. An economist added, "It's just that I want to do it. I want to do it in fairness to the students." One English Transformer explained the reason she felt instructors choose to be inclusive. "Just the faculty member him/herself. They must take the initiative," to infuse their classes. Professing to be a self-directed scientist, one psychologist offered, "Just from myself. It's only me, nobody has said do this."

On the other hand, some of the faculty members in their interviews attributed their push to be more inclusive to a personal belief that students must be ready to meet the multicultural workforce after graduation. An additive psychologist made several references to the students' need to be informed of other cultures before entering the workforce.

> I think…is necessary in the world we live in. We have more diverse students now. My course is training people for nursing, food services,

> [and] physical therapy. I think for them a little awareness that people come from different backgrounds with different attitudes....

One history instructor explained his motivating force to prepare students for the impending workforce of the 21st century.

> I think it is important for the workforce also, because... I am shocked at how little understanding and knowledge each group might have. It's going to be more important in the 21st century. We have already seen an increased interest in the business community and all sorts of foreign languages that we never dreamed would be possible, like Chinese. And what I tell students is unless they get on this bus they are not facing the future because with increased communication and the way jobs are international now it becomes important to know and understand many many groups with a pluralistic view. It's going to be important to learn foreign languages and things like that, even for an occupational-technical student because that's a circumstance with which they will have to contend—business trips to Japan or France or China—and a knowledge of the culture and a knowledge of the people.

### The Institutional Environment

Some of the faculty members who are inclusive as a result of their own value set also happen to find themselves in an institutional environment that supports their actions towards this inclusiveness. The environment can play an integral part in influencing faculty members to react to any institutional problem, and multicultural education is no different. Since people who populate these environments have different perspectives, each educational environment is necessarily different. The three colleges all appear to have generated very different environments, vis-a-vis diversity. Each of the colleges is discussed separately.

Greenfield Community College

Greenfield Community College, according to the faculty members interviewed there, maintained a positive institutional atmosphere to support them toward integrating their curriculum. This atmosphere, in fact, reflects the institutional mission and multicultural diversity statements adopted by the College. The Multicultural Diversity Statement, developed in 1992, commits the faculty and staff to "recognize the cultural differences of background, experience, and national origin, and seek to promote a genuine understanding of and appreciation for these differences" ([Greenfield] Community College, 1997, p. 2). According to the faculty interviewed, the administration at Greenfield was dedicated to this statement and aggressively participated in the process to make it successful. Providing the stimulus for change among the faculty and staff, the president actively participated in many initiatives. Minority enrollment increased due to the willingness of the president to visit the high schools and encourage seniors to enroll in Greenfield. According to one history instructor,

> That's one of [President's name] most proud moments here. We were probably running around 8 or 9% minority in African American enrollment ten years ago. We looked at the demographics and census to see that it should be somewhere around 18 or 19%. And that's where we are now.

> We had moments of concern but we have been allowed to recruit in the high school and in the counties we serve.

Although, according to one faculty member, multiculturalism has "been a concern of the faculty for years," diversity appears not to have been adopted as an institutional goal until the then president arrived at the College. Each of the seven persons interviewed from Greenfield spoke of the president's goal for and leadership to realize diversity. Multiculturalism was "one of our President's top priorities and has been since [name] became President." The President formed a Task Force with the express purpose of promoting cultural diversity at the college and it has been instrumental in promoting a positive and supportive atmosphere at GCC. The chair of the Task Force, an Additive economist, further explained the state of affairs at the College when the group was created:

> I think for the most part, people were curious to learn. They were surprised to learn that minorities perceived a lot of things in a much different way than intended. The Task Force started to wind down after two years. We presented some panels to the faculty and staff, which were extremely well attended. I think that when some of the students spoke you could have heard a pin drop. Everybody was very attentive and I think they heard the message. Since then, what had been a Task Force has become a Standing Committee and they continue to present programs.

Faculty members, who placed on either the Additive or Transformation Approach level on my matrix, agreed that the Task Force turned standing

Committee on Diversity has helped to foster the supportive environment. "Here at the College," commented a psychology instructor, "we talk about [multiculturalism] certainly informally and we talk about it in some formal arenas. I think it's one of those things we could use more discussion on. We have a Committee on Diversity and they have certainly made an attempt to make us all more knowledgeable." An English Transformer further iterated,

> We have had some very good programs. Not just programs but programs that have had an impact. Whether they are about people with handicaps [or] people of color. We have different people from the community come in to participate. Any time we experience different languages, foods and music, we increase our level of understanding.

A second part of the College's strategic plan was to increase minority faculty members as well. "[The President] made it [a] priority to go out and recruit many more minorities. The makeup of the faculty however has not changed." Others concur that the President made concerted efforts to recruit minority faculty members. "We had an African American woman to come here as Dean with excellent credentials. The faculty, for the most part, liked her, but she left after one year. I don't know why."

In relating what he felt attributed to faculty members being more inclusive in the curriculum, one English faculty member from Greenfield Community College summed up much of what had been expressed by other faculty. "The President's enthusiasm is kind of infectious and we all sort of got swept up in the multicultural theme, not because we were directed but because it seemed to make sense: something whose time had come. That's just encouragement... "

Enthusiasm is contagious. An environment that positively supports multiculturalism positively supports those who promote it or who are inclined to move in that direction The development activity, in addition to the strategic action, undoubtedly helped to open the minds of others, converting them to see its importance, relevance, and necessity. Four of the seven faculty members from Greenfield Community College achieved placement on the Transformation Approach level on my matrix. The other three were found to be on the Additive Approach level. Since I did not interview mathematics faculty at Greenfield I do not know if they too would have been more inclined to be inclusive than their disciplinary colleagues from the other two institutions. However, a positive supportive institutional atmosphere appears to be appreciated by faculty members who also understand the urgency of preparing the students for this rapidly growing multicultural society.

Upstate Community College

The environment at Upstate Community College is quite different from the other two college studied. Unlike Greenfield, UCC has not defined a policy on cultural diversity or multicultural education. Rather, the faculty and staff are responsible to a Vision Statement in addition to the institutional Mission Statement. The Vision Statement reads, "the College will create an institutional environment that fosters high ethical standards, professionalism, and a sense of community." ([Upstate] Community College, 1997, p. 1). The statement, while speaking of appropriate professional objectives for the College, is nonetheless devoid of any consideration of diversity issues.

One might translate the phrase "sense of community" to mean that the environment should reflect the diversity represented in the region or in the student body, but it is far from explicit. The population surrounding UCC is over 400,000 people with slightly more than 1% of that number enrolled in the college. The student body is approximately 73% Caucasian, 22% African American, and the remaining 5% represent the other minorities (see table 2). With the demographics of the service area being mirrored by the college's student body, one would assume that the institution would be sensitive to the issue of diversity. This institutional dedication to generic professional values appears to do little to orient the College community to ensuring a supportive atmosphere for enhancing cultural diversity and multicultural points of view.

None of the UCC faculty indicated that the administration was an advocate for inclusion of multiculturalism in the curriculum at the College. Not one of the faculty members interviewed indicated that UCC deserved any credit for playing a part in whatever level of inclusion they have achieved. Explaining why she began to infuse her courses with multicultural issues, an Additive faculty member said, "No, not here. I got interested from going to a teaching of philosophy conference several years ago." One of the English Transformers disclosed the same absence of institutional support. "No, I haven't seen any pros or cons. No push towards or against. Neither one. It's pretty much up to me or the individual teacher."

Despite the fact that UCC appears to have a neutral atmosphere for diversity issues, three of the faculty members were found to be Transformers. Obviously, faculty members can, with some commitment, be inclusive as a result of their own personal value system and educational training. Of the remaining two, the psychologist is on the Additive Approach level and the mathematician is on the Exclusion Approach level.

### Flatlands Community College

Unlike the other two colleges' goal statements, the Vision Statement for Flatlands Community College addresses the atmosphere at the institution. According to Flatlands' catalogue (1998),

> By the year 2001: [Flatlands] Community College will have transformed itself. The work and learning environment will be superior, enhanced by judicious use of advanced technology, by attractive and well-maintained facilities, and by a genuinely caring atmosphere that values and celebrates diversity. (p. 2)

Further, to emphasize and define Flatland's commitment to diversity, a subsection of the Vision Statement, entitled Values Statement, explains that:

> As an institution of higher education, [Flatlands] appreciates and promotes an understanding of the value of diversity in ideas, peoples, and cultures. We must reflect this respect for the value of diversity in our curriculum, our extra-curricular activities, our employment practices and our personal interactions. (p. 2)

The authors of this Vision Statement paint an almost perfect picture of the ideal higher education institution. Having an institutional atmosphere that values and celebrates diversity would clearly indicate that some restructuring of the way that the disciplines are taught has taken place or is in the process of occurring and that the curricula are being infused with multicultural perspectives. From the responses I received from my interviewees, this is not the case.

In spite of the Vision Statement, the six faculty members perceive the institutional environment at Flatlands very differently from each other. Of the six faculty members, two are math instructors/Exclusionists. One of the Exclusionists interprets Flatlands' goals for diversity as relating exclusively to the human resources procedures of hiring minorities. The junior mathematician stated: "...and they tell us lower people who we are suppose to hire and who we are not to hire based on skin color.... I could see that diversity to [the president] meant color of your skin". Thus, rather than focusing on changing the curriculum, this faculty member appears to be more concerned with how the concepts of diversity relate to work life issues. His definition of diversity at the institution seems to be tied to his personal reactions to the actions or policies of the President, who is a minority member.

One economics instructor, whom I determined to be on the Additive Approach level, possesses quite a different belief of what is actually happening at FCC. He expressed that an effort to be more inclusive of multicultural perspectives in all aspects of campus life is inevitable and is being endorsed by the administration. According to this economics instructor, "this just happens to be one of [the President's] concerns. But I don't see anybody pressuring anyone." This instructor understands that the stated goal of the College is to develop a positive atmosphere for diversity. He has yet however, to take the necessary steps to restructure his own syllabus and course content to become a Transformer.

The remaining three instructors, found to be on the Transformation Approach level, belong to different disciplines, i.e., sociology and English. Contrary to the Additive at FCC, two of the Transformers do not agree that a positive supportive atmosphere of multicultural views, concepts, and issues exists at Flatlands. For them, the Vision Statement has yet to be realized. In fact, individual efforts to change the curriculum have been met with resistance within departments. One Transformer tried to introduce to his colleagues a textbook that was very inclusive of authors other than the traditional Eurocentric canon and would present many views. "A few years ago, [multiculturalism] was an issue in my department. So I suggested this book. Nobody else liked it, but I have stuck with it." Another English Transformer reminisced, "One of my colleagues is in charge of international education and she has fought to try to bring that perspective to the school. She gets no support; it's all done on her own." These two faculty members perceive a lack of support to adopt a more inclusive curriculum among at least some of their colleagues. They perceive that any advances must spring from the individual who may receive little positive reinforcement from colleagues.

Seemingly more informed about future projects than other faculty whom I interviewed at FCC, the sociology instructor from this group accurately reflecting the Vision Statement, added,

> [Multiculturalism] is something that has been emphasized and encouraged. All of the syllabi should reflect some incorporation. They are looking at seeing it incorporated in all of our general education components, revealed in some of our learning objectives that we include with our syllabus.

This sociologist appears to be better informed than others from this institution about issues related to multicultural education. Unfortunately, I failed to ask her during the interview, to clarify who "they" are. She clearly sees some efforts being made toward realizing the Vision of the Institution.

Of this group of six instructors at FCC, only the sociology and economics instructors sense an atmosphere supportive of multicultural perspectives. Clearly different definitions of an atmosphere that values and celebrates diversity reign among the faculty. Unlike Greenfield, only one of the faculty mentioned institutional workshops or formal faculty discussions about diversity. Although some of the faculty indicated that the administration supports the concept of diversity, leadership that might encourage institutional acceptance and realization of the Vision Statement, appears to be lacking. At least one faculty member views the actions of the President to be focused on minority hiring preference, not on curricular matters.

## The Disciplines

The discipline of the faculty member is the third variable found to be influential in the faculty member's level of integration of multicultural education. Faculty members see their academic world according to their disciplinary paradigm, which is composed of an ontology, epistemology, methodology, and axiology (Kuhn, 1970). However, even within specific discipline not all faculty members are the same. Within the disciplinary paradigm, different schools of thought may be found. Some faculty members, for example, adhere to one way of thinking within a discipline, while others abide another school of thought. Not surprising, I found that the faculty member's discipline seems to impact their approach to diversity issues. In addition, community college faculty members are more likely to be oriented toward the teaching of their discipline than toward research and conceptualization activities (Clark, 1987). Further, it is not surprising that I found that the textbooks may have a significant influence on the faculty's infusion of diversity in their teaching of the disciplines.

Several faculty members suggested during the interviews that diversity issues were easier to integrate into some disciplines than others. The reason may be related to the nature of the disciplines, which have been divided by their "hard" and "soft" attributes (Biglan, 1973). Biglan describes a dimension whereby "hard" disciplines, at the extreme negative end,[2] are characterized by a paradigm based on principles, objectivity, and pure facts of the subject matter. "Hard" disciplines, such as the biological sciences and mathematics, fit this description because, according to Donald (1986), the content and methods are "considered to be well or highly structured" (p. 297). The scientific and empirical nature of hard disciplines presents faculty members with a difficult challenge when it comes to infusing multicultural perspectives into the curriculum because the existing paradigms do not encourage flexible interpretations of facts.

---

[2] Biglan's dimensional scale is merely a metaphoric graphical representation of the amount of leeway a discipline has for interpreting the facts or principles related to a discipline and the ability o be creative with the subject matter. Since disciplines fall on the scale based on the adaptability to changing paradigm, the further away from the point of origin, the more negative or "hard" a discipline appears because of its presumed inflexibility.

It appears the more "hard" the discipline, the more difficult the perception faculty members have in perceiving ways to include multicultural concepts in their courses. Two of the mathematicians were adamant about the issue. "Math does not lend itself for integration of multicultural education, and "Math is math." The faculty members rationalize their lack of attention to diversity based on their understanding of their discipline.

The three mathematicians, all of whom were located on the Exclusion Approach level, placed very little emphasis on the increasingly inclusive nature of their textbooks. Two of the math instructors made general comments such as,

> The pictures have changed. They are in color and the names have changed. Asian and Spanish names appear more. They use José instead of John. But the culture, that's not an issue for me.... Textbooks are geared to the level. We make sure the reading level is not too high.

The senior math teacher suggested that the authors are merely being politically correct when he commented,

> Umm, there's probably some…Of course, they're [the authors of textbooks] being influenced by what's going on. There are pictures of mathematicians in the books. And there certainly has been some emphasis on giving attention to women in math. I think that's a feminist thing, not a multicultural thing. But I just don't see any great influence in math of this multiculturalism.

Economics and psychology, which could be classified as quasi-hard disciplines, represent the other disciplines taught by this sample of faculty. They fall in the middle of Biglan's dimension scale and are not as plagued by principles and facts as course content in the hard disciplines, but they still have a very strong orientation towards empiricism. An economics instructor explained why the debate on multiculturalism had not affected his teaching. "We teach what 's called 'positive economics'. Basically factual reports." According to Biglan (1973), "these are fields that strive for a paradigm; but have yet to achieve one" (p. 202). Donald (1986) further describes these social sciences (economics and psychology) as being on "the idiosyncratic side of the scale although closer to the paradigmatic side" (p. 297). Some economists and psychologists feel that "they have been trained to discern and formulate patterns" (Donald, 1986, p. 303) and sometimes refer to themselves as empirical scientists.

The economics and psychology faculty, whom I interviewed, have achieved the Additive Approach level and they offered differing views of the importance of textbooks. The economics instructors make no attempt to let the texts help to influence their teaching. One of them rather unenthusiastically stated that the text "does deal with the issue of minority unemployment and that sort of thing." The other emphatically stated, "No, they are about the same as twenty years ago."

The psychology faculty members, also Additives, are more aware than the mathematicians of the changes in their texts but, like the economists, refer to them rather nonchalantly. One stated, "[they are] more representative of the different cultures now." Another commented, "if you look at a Psych book from ten years ago and you look now, the pictures are very, very different." None of the five Additive instructors placed great emphasis on the importance of changing textbooks nor led me to believe that textbooks could contribute to their advancing to another level on my matrix.

According to Biglan (1973), the disciplines at the "positive end[3] emphasize creative approaches to their subject matter, while those at the negative end emphasize empirical approaches" (p. 201). Contrary to the economics and psychology, sociology and history are positioned near the positive end of Biglan's scale. Demonstrating this proclivity toward creative techniques, a history instructor offered, "I've actually worked to be more inclusive. ...Actually, I had to work to make myself happy that I have enough material to adequately cover the components." Indeed, although the nature of the discipline may permit creativity, faculty still must choose to work at being inclusive. A transformed sociologist commented when responding to how the debate has affected her discipline:

---

[3] Contrary to the negative end of the scale, the further away from the point of origin, the more positive or "soft" a discipline appears because of its presumed flexibility to changing paradigm.

> in terms of how much we incorporate. I know for some faculty they had to change quite dramatically on some of their teaching styles and units in order to include ANY issues about culture. I know for some, it is easy to incorporate. For others, it is not so easy. But I think they should make an effort so students understand that we should not be as ethnocentric as we are; that America is not the only country in the world; that English is not the only language in the world and, that it is not just white man's history.

The remaining faculty members, historians, sociologists, and English instructors are Transformers and almost unanimously stated that the changes being made in the textbooks are positive and beneficial to their teaching. The sociology faculty members took the position that their textbooks have been representative of other cultures for many years now. Apparently though, only recently have these texts acknowledged that American society is composed of more than Black and White relations. "If you go back to the late '50s or early '60s, sociology in the textbooks then were inclusive of African American issues and problems in history. There is an attempt to include Hispanics and Asians now, particularly those populations," a senior sociology instructor explained.

Both history Transformers feel that history textbooks have become more inclusive and use the text to further their course objectives of inclusiveness. One historian explained that

> The textbooks have some good stuff but unless I highlight it [the students are] not going to think it worthwhile. We use the class to talk about real simplistic topics. The history text has been a great vehicle for that

because [the authors] always try to have a multicultural kind of display in the essays.

The "soft" disciplines described by Biglan (1973), as "the areas at the extreme positive end—the humanities and education areas—are not paradigmatic. Rather, content and method in these areas tend to be idiosyncratic" (p. 202). These disciplines, or fields of study, favor individual interpretation and permit divergent concepts (Donald, 1986). Thus, their nature more easily facilitates the infusion of diverse perspectives–in this case, multiculturalism–into the curriculum. English faculty members are privy to a plethora of textbooks that include many different voices. In most cases, instructors use several different books and rely quite heavily on the newer anthologies that de-emphasize the traditional canon. Additionally, they have two avenues to infuse the different voices—Freshman Composition and America Literature. At least one English instructor uses distinct teaching methods in the two different courses. However, because the textbooks have become so inclusive there is still an opportunity to introduce different voices and ideas in both of these courses.

The other English transformers complimented the newer more inclusive textbooks and anthologies. The depth of available sources has permitted them to experiment and to vary their inclusion. One instructor commented, "How I go about choosing textbooks has changed—I look for different voices. It seems that every semester I have to redo my syllabus because I am trying to include different voices." Throughout the interviews, I found no faculty member who stated that textbooks or anthologies alone were the driving force behind integrating multicultural perspectives into their classes. However, recent changes in textbooks seemed to assist several of the English instructors in integrating their classes with different perspectives.

The problem of this research however, was not merely to determine how inclusive the faculty are, or to understand why the faculty makes excuses about not being inclusive, but also to evaluate the strength of the presentation of multicultural issues through general education courses to students within specific applied programs.

## General Education

Regardless of the degree program—Nursing, Business Management, or Electronics—an 18-credit minimum of general education courses is required for degree completion. Since the content of the major courses within these applied programs are field-specific and skill oriented, the primary amount of multicultural education available to students is taught in the six general education courses. The question then becomes how much multicultural education do the students receive in these courses?

Generally speaking, all three programs require two semesters of English, at least one semester of math, and one each of a humanities and social sciences elective. The one exception is Nursing, which has no mathematics course requirement, but requires a specific level of proficiency before admittance into the program. Also all three programs require one psychology and/or economics course (see figure 2).

The faculty members who participated in this study, along with other colleagues, teach the general education courses at the three community colleges. Since the general education classes are not restricted to a specific curriculum, transfer students may also enroll in them.[4] Based on my analysis of the faculty interviews and the content of their courses, the amount of multicultural education presented to students within the specific occupational-technical degree programs is uneven and limited.

The general education mathematics requirement for students in those occupational-technical degree programs are not very likely to be an avenue from which to gain any knowledge of multicultural concepts and issues. The Exclusionists, who are the mathematicians, traditionally have not presented any multicultural perspectives to their students. The math instructors interviewed are aware of multicultural education, but have made no strides toward integrating their curriculum. One might think that the addition of a multicultural perspective in mathematics is of no consequence since numbers are numbers and formulae are formulae.

---

[4] Since I was not able to interview every faculty member at each college who taught those courses I cannot be definitive with my conclusions. Other faculty members were contacted and declined to participate in the study. They may have declined to participate because they were not including multicultural perspectives in their classes. However, I have no way to make that determination. Further, there is no way to determine whether or not all occupational-technical students enroll in general education course sections taught by this group of faculty members.

However, implicit within the Exclusion perspective is a refusal to acknowledge the presence and importance of the various groups that compose our society. Without such recognition, students who belong to the White majority tend to be reinforced in their social place as a result of familiar names being used in examples and problems. On the other hand, minority students are also "kept in their place," that is, ignored as bona fide members of this society. This social place is obsolete and harmful. Displaying a surprising stereotype, one mathematician explained, "I don't use ethnics when I give examples, unless I am talking about a Basketball team." At the lowest level of inclusion, the mathematicians might recognize that minorities have made many contributions in the world of mathematics. Their various accomplishments should be recognized for their worth in forming this nation.

Most applied degree programs require one course in psychology. Business Management requires its students to complete at least one economics course in addition to the psychology course. Faculty members in this study who teach psychology and economics placed within the Additive Approach level on my matrix. These instructors reported being driven to be inclusive by their own value set, however they only add selective information about non-White groups. Indeed, students are more likely to be introduced to factual and non-offensive multicultural concepts and issues as they study the courses in economics and psychology. These courses are infused with multicultural perspectives even though it can not be readily discerned from the course content. However, characteristic of the Additive Approach, these faculty members only, "acknowledge that which is useful information" in their opinions, about cultures other than the dominant culture. No mention is made of struggles or oppression of the ethnic groups that comprise today's society.

Additives instructors perceive only the basic principles and essentials of their disciplines and do not see the need for external forces or incentives to assist in the integration process. One economist gave a clear example of this characteristic when asked about his supplemental readings.

> We can, in economics, be more inclusive. The textbook does deal with the issue of minority unemployment and that sort of thing. I do talk about the unfairness of wage distribution-that sort of thing. [But], I don't bring in any supplemental materials—physical materials as such. I talk about the economic effects of discrimination and that sort of thing.

This type of teaching philosophy actually helps to preserve the dominant culture by only exposing students to the easily observed inequity without further analyzing the different viewpoints and concepts related to other cultures.

To fulfill the English general education requirement in these programs means that the students probably will encounter the instructors who fit my Transformation Approach level. In these courses, students are introduced to and shown an appreciation for authors from a variety of cultural backgrounds. The textbooks used by this group of instructors are infused with many different literary voices. There is no shortage of multicultural perspectives, concepts and issues presented in the courses of these instructors in the Transformation group. Students are presented with issues and problems that allow them to explore the historical and current problems of less dominant groups. Characteristic of the Transformation Approach is the recognition of and emphasis on a balanced view of all the peoples who helped to shape this nation. The Transformers have redefined their syllabi, handouts, tests, etc., which are inclusive.

In addition to the English faculty, the four remaining Transformers are instructors for the social sciences electives. As such, students are likely to receive reinforcement of multicultural concepts that create a more accurate perspective of our society. According to one sociologist, "multicultural education is an issue across this country and we deal with it as such." True to that statement, this sociologist provides her students with a global perspective because "the students do need to become more aware of diversity."

Given the distribution of faculty members who teach in the general education courses and who have earned placement in either the Additive or Transformation Approach, it seems likely that occupational-technical students who attend one of these three institutions will experience some measure of multicultural education as they complete 15 of the 18 required credits for graduation. Key here is that the student must enroll in a class taught by an instructor who is at least on the Additive Approach level. The level of chance involved is not reassuring. Exposure to a balanced and fair world perspective should not be left to chance rather, it should be a requirement for all student lest they be unprepared to meet the multicultural challenges of the 21st century.

## Conclusions

> Valuing the individual has always been a bedrock belief in our company. and you can't value someone without fully appreciating that person's uniqueness. Promoting diversity in the workplace in not just a choice we make because it's the right thing to do. It's a business imperative without which we cannot succeed. (Thompson, 2000, p. 136)

Chief Executive Officers of major companies all throughout the nation are echoing Thompson's words. Business and industry are looking for employees who not only can communicate with different people, but who can understand and appreciate differences. Graduates of 2000 and beyond will be confronted with a multicultural workforce with whom they must, at a minimum, demonstrate tolerance, but preferably understanding and acceptance. It is incumbent upon educational institutions to educate and train graduates who can be successful in this diverse workforce. Academe can ill afford not to prepare them for immediate employment. And nowhere is this more imperative than at community colleges. After all, preparation for the world of work is one of the missions of this education sector.

One of the issues surrounding the preparation of students was how much exposure of multicultural perspectives they received while completing the AAS degree. After interviewing some faculty members at three institutions and analyzing their course content using the matrix that I designed containing six levels of integration, I determine that the amount of multiculturalism added ranges from none to considerable exposure. The levels of integration of multicultural education in the curricula of the three occupational-technical programs vary by disciplines and institutions. Clearly the true amount of multicultural education integrated into the curriculum depends on the individual faculty member and his/her commitment to achieving pluralism. Variables, such as a supportive atmosphere, more inclusive textbooks, and personal values fuel the faculty member's level of commitment.

As more individual faculty members across a variety of disciplines introduce concepts of other cultures, the more the curriculum is strengthened by that perspective and the more students' learning and understanding are reinforced. The more balanced the perspective of the curriculum, the more students receive training enabling them to accept others within the multicultural workforce.

During the analysis of the course contents and interviews, I began to question the number of levels in my matrix. It appeared that some of the characteristics were overlapping, some were too specific, and others were not needed at all. After reevaluating the matrix, I maintain that the Exclusion Approach level is absolutely necessary to keep. It was important to discover the fact that there are faculty members who feel that there is no place in their disciplines to introduce and discuss any perspective related to multiculturalism. The mathematics instructors recognize the need for students to be more cognizant of other cultures because of the working conditions after graduation, but feel that any multicultural perspective the students gain should be taught in another discipline because, "math doesn't lend itself " to be inclusive. They rationalize the lack of infusion of multicultural perspectives by saying that it is the nature of the discipline. Mathematics, after all, it is highly structured with principles, pure facts, and objectivity. Further, they feel that there are no social values implicit in mathematics.

Additionally, their failure to acknowledge contributions by persons other than those of the dominant culture reinforces the White majority student's positive self image of his/her social place in society and likewise, minority student's negative self image and his/her so-called "place" in society. I see this as another subtle way to preserve the dominant culture. This level must be kept in the matrix because it represents, within this group, not only complete avoidance of, but also an aggressively resistant ideology to inclusiveness.

The Contributions Approach concept defined as faculty members inserting ethnic heroes, foods, holidays, etc. into curricular discussions, is rarely employed by academe any more. Most of the holidays and festivals celebrated that would place instructors on this level are celebrated nationwide by all and are recognized as national and/or federal holidays, thereby requiring no overt effort by faculty to recognize these days. Very few colleges engage in these types of celebrations alone anymore. Hence, this level could easily be eliminated from my matrix.

The Additive Approach, in some respects, is just one step above the Exclusionists. Additives are characterized by adding multicultural concepts, ideas, and viewpoints to their courses with an underlying assumption that the assimilation of minority cultures is appropriate. At this level, oppression is never discussed. Supplementary materials are kept to a minimum so as not to risk students being exposed to diversity issues forces external to that course. Additives present a picture of being on the road to transform their courses when, in actuality, they do little more for their classes than the curricular equivalent of simply wearing green on St. Patrick's Day. In the end, they make few changes to the overall structure of the curriculum.

On the Transformation Approach level, faculty members introduce students to other cultures, and thus foster an appreciation for what those cultures have done to help form this society. However, the efforts of faculty members whom I interviewed, on this level, appear to have become static. They did not indicate that they were making changes that would advance them to the next level. The transformation level can provide a safe haven for those instructors who do not want to push students to make social and ethical decisions and take appropriate actions to change society. This stance can serve to preserve the dominant culture in its de facto position, which just may be the intended result of these faculty members.

I may have been over zealous in designing the next two levels, the Decision-Making and Social Action Approach and the Integrated Approach. These two levels could be combined to form a level that would stress decision-making that leads the students to become more pluralistic. To think that cultural pluralism has, in fact, been realized in this contemporary society is probably unrealistic, especially since many faculty members seem to be comfortable on the transformation level.

Given what I have learned, I would revise my matrix to contain only four approaches to ascertain the level of multicultural integration being taught: the Exclusion Approach, the Additive Approach, the Transformation Approach, and the Integrated Approach. The Exclusion Approach would be designed with intent to uncover all those faculty members who refuse to recognize any culture other than the traditional Eurocentric. The Additive Approach would be structured to screen in all faculty members who add multicultural perspectives of a more simplistic kind, whether it is merely a celebration of Cinque de Mayo, Octoberfest, or a unit on Chinese poetry.

The Transformation Approach would remain as is. Characteristically, faculty members who belong here are making strides towards more understanding and appreciation of the different ethnic groups in our society. The final level, The Integrated Approach would be a combination of my original levels five and six. Faculty members who teach decision-making and problem solving skills while trying to encourage equal representation and voices would be in classified as the Integrated Approach.

The reevaluation of my matrix necessitates a brief comparison to Banks typology of approaches that I used as one model. Both approaches now consist of four levels with at least two having the same characteristics, as well as the same nomenclature. The other two stages in both my matrix and Banks, which have different names, have minute differences primarily relating to the amount of social action to be taken upon decisions that are made.

The biggest difference with the approaches lies within level one. Banks (1993) begins with the assumption that all faculty members teaching these courses do something to infuse multicultural perspectives, even if it just to read the "I Have a Dream" speech on the third Monday of January annually. My contention was, and still is after the study, that some faculty members refuse to recognize any aspect of multiculturalism.

Banks and I are in agreement on the next level of our matrixes. Both second levels, the Additive Approach, are characterized by the addition of multicultural concepts, ideas, and viewpoints into the curriculum without changing the structure of the course. Banks (1993) interprets the shortcoming of this level as, "the events, concepts, issues, and problems selected for study are selected using mainstream-centric and Eurocentric criteria and perspectives" (p. 203). Concurring with Banks, I interpret it as merely a subtle, al beit effective, way to maintain the dominant culture.

The Transformation Approach, our third levels, is based, not only on the inclusion of multiple perspectives, but also on the inclusion of detailed information about the struggles and oppression endured by the minority groups to make this country what it is today. The goal on this level is to have students look at issues from other viewpoints. Since most faculty members I interviewed did not seem to be interested in moving to the next level, I also refer to this level as the comfort zone. They feel that the challenge has been met simply because the courses have been transformed.

Slight differences are found in the fourth level of our matrixes. The first, quite obvious one, is that the names are different. Banks uses the Social Action Approach to express his concept of students being taught to make decisions and formulate plans of action to eliminate problems. Inherent in my fourth level, the Integrated Approach, is the same basic concept. However, in my approach I expect faculty members to work toward pluralism by incorporating equal representation and voices in any decision made to ensure a democratic environment. In summary, the primary differences between the concept that Banks developed and mine are in the first level of integration. He assumed that faculty members recognize the contributions of other cultures, even if only minimal. I maintain that there are faculty members who simply refuse to recognize any contributions made by persons other than those of the current dominant culture.

Finally, the question becomes is it possible for all courses to become totally integrated? Possible? Yes, I think it is possible for all courses to be integrated. There are two ways to realize that possibility. One, it could result from a legislative mandate either from the local or state governments. Since the community colleges receive a certain amount of funding from these sources, it is possible that politicians or educational bureaucrats could force the issue. Undoubtedly, this tactic would not be the most popular or effective way to realize the integration of the curriculum, but it could be done. Clearly though the impetus for this sort of change is not likely to come from politicians and bureaucrats. Two, contrary to a mandate, the faculty and administration within the colleges could decide to make the changes on their own. Some institutions have already begun to move in this direction by at least seeing the need to articulate a change within their missions and vision statements. These statements must be more that just platitudes in order to be realized; they must be adopted in full. Through consistent efforts to enable faculty members to rethink their teaching framework, the curriculum can become integrated. Reaching level four for some courses would indeed be more difficult than others. However, with years of labor intensive work, all courses including the "hard" disciplines could become integrated.

The real issue here is: Will it ever happen? Again, I say yes. Not next week, next year, and maybe not in the next ten years. I contend though that with the rapid demographic changes occurring in the country, i.e., population rapidly changing to a population of color, it is inevitable. Colleges will, in order to stay in business, have to enroll more people of color who will demand more faculty members of color. The cycle will continue and eventually, as this "colorization" permeates various levels of state and federal government, the faces of the politicians will have changed. These political decision-makers will be of color. Then the financial elite, who support and indirectly manage these institutions, will eventually change their perspective out of economic self-interest. And the culture that is so tenaciously being held today will have changed.

## Recommendations

The following recommendations are intended to assist the Marantz Community College System, the administration at the institutions in the system, and the liberal arts faculty members who teach the general education courses. These general education courses provide avenues for integrating the curriculum with multicultural perspectives. The recognition and appreciation of other cultures is essential to the total education process if we are effectively to prepare students for the multicultural workforce of the 21st century.

### Recommendation for the System

According to Bowser (1995), "the nation can not afford to forgo continuous educational reform and expansion if it expects to continue enjoying high economic and political status in the world community" (p. xviii). If it is the intent of the Marantz Community College System to maintain a respectable standing in the state's educational system, it must begin to reform the contents of general education courses.

Statements from chief executive officers of major corporations express the need for employees, who not only can perform skilled jobs, but who are prepared to face the challenges of the multicultural workforce. The responsibility for educating and training a large portion of new employees rests on the shoulders of the community college systems nationwide.

Given the fact that students graduating in the occupational-technical degree programs have only 18 credits hours to achieve this pre-employment appreciation and understanding of other cultures which will prepare them for work, it is imperative that the system makes a positive and swift move toward satisfying this requirement. Consequently, it is my recommendation that the system makes provisions, both logistically and financially, for ALL faculty members who teach general education courses, to become knowledgeable and appreciative of different cultures. Faculty would then be allowed to participate in an important sector of the community college mission—preparation for work immediately upon graduation. Changes may have to be made to the existing mission statement for the system. According to Jones, et. al. (1995), "... If institutions of higher education are to make significant gains in creating a truly inclusive and multicultural curriculum...colleges must (1) build such an intent into the mission and goals statement and (2) link all budget decisions to the priorities established" (p. 174).

Provisions for such an undertaking will undoubtedly involves a number of different ideas and concepts. Each spring the system hosts a two and one-half day conference consisting of guest speakers, presenters and concurrent sessions. Traditionally, the theme of the conference is centered around an issue of current concern for the system and the member institutions, i.e., Student Retention, Technology in the Classroom, or Student Learning Centers. Speakers are most often from four-year institutions, business and industry, or from community colleges outside the system. Presenters, who are experts on the issues being discussed, at the concurrent sessions most often come from community colleges nationally or from local institutions.

With reference to the annual conference sponsored by the system, the next one should be focused entirely on multicultural education and how to successfully become more inclusive in teaching their disciplines. Conference planners should be carefully chosen so that "no single major cultural group should dominate the team" (Jones & Young, 1995, p. 175) and to be as inclusive as possible. Persons should be invited to speak and conduct workshops from every discipline. It is extraordinarily important to find at least one mathematician who has successfully integrated a math course with multicultural perspectives.

Since this conference is a major gathering for many of the Presidents, middle management, faculty and staff, it would be prime time to initiate a major campaign announcing a five-year plan dedicated to the realization of a system-wide mission of inclusion. It could be billed as being among the first in the nation to recognize the reality and future of the nation and the workforce. The announcement would be followed up with the system's public relations department making more appeals to increase the public and institutional support and recognition from academe to sustain such an initiative.

The system may need to be reminded that the community plays a pivotal role in successful education reform especially at the community college level. The community college educates and trains people, in part, based on the needs of local business and industry. Thus, that segment of the population should be in support of and involved with any new curriculum initiative. The public relations department should solicit their appearances in advertisements in the brochures, newspapers and in radio and television.

Institutional support. especially the faculty, is essential since they are the ones, in this case, who will be carrying out the curriculum changes. Recognizing that some faculty will resist, it is important to urge the supporters to aggressively work towards convincing the others of the importance of reform.

The system should also provide financial support to the colleges to hire persons who could serve as mentors to help in the training of inexperienced instructors. Additionally the system should direct the President of member institutions to formulate faculty development programs that should be administered by each college Dean of Instruction or equivalent.

### Recommendation for Administration at Member Institutions

Given the system's mission and goal statements of inclusiveness of multiculturalism for each institution, I recommend that the administration at member institutions aggressively develop and implement a program with the express intent to train faculty members how to make their courses more inclusive of multicultural perspectives. Any initiative of this magnitude has to be entered into with dedication and commitment from all involved. It is crucial that the administration first elicit support from the faculty members who will actually be involved in this endeavor.

With reference to the changes that the faculty members are being asked to make, Jones & Young (1995) suggested, "For faculty to change, they need incentives, rewards, changed expectations and even denials of scarce resources (i.e., promotion, tenure, grants, etc.)" (p. 171). In light of their suggestion, each college President should start by incorporating into the annual evaluation process categories that would place a value on activities of faculty toward the overall goal of becoming inclusive. These evaluation criteria can be used to recommend promotions and/or non-renewal of contracts.

Each disciplinary unit containing general education courses must be held accountable. Such units should be required to develop goals for integrating multicultural education into the discipline. The President should direct the budget manager to create a budget guideline to implement the faculty development program. Working in conjunction with the Dean of Instruction, each department should be asked to devise a schedule that would allow some faculty to be released for a semester from normal teaching responsibilities to attend workshops, conferences, and/or serve as mentors to other teachers. This would have to be done on a rotating basis. The idea here is to train a core of faculty and have them assist in training other faculty members. Faculty members who may have experience with Women's Studies or other reformed curricular programs may be considered valuable resources and should be used, if possible, for sharing ideas, helpful hints and management techniques for such an initiative.

The administration should encourage faculty members to write grants to obtain funds to pay for curricular reform, and to fund the cost of sending faculty to summer workshops in other countries. Additionally, faculty should be rewarded with release time in order to revamp existing courses and to design new inclusive courses. Within the allotted budget per discipline, funds should be included for travel to conferences, national conventions, etc. related to multiculturalism.

Money should also be available for the department heads to bring visiting faculty to assist in transformation of the classes.

The administration should also seek to recruit faculty members from different cultures. As more minority students enroll there will be a cry to hire more minority faculty. That does not mean that the existing faculty members should not be participating in the faculty development program defined above. To the contrary, I think that all current and new faculty members should participate, regardless of ethnicity.

## Recommendation for General Education Faculty

In order for the system's proposed goal on multiculturalism to be realized, it is absolutely essential that the faculty members support the cause. I therefore recommend that each general education faculty member be required, as a part of their overall teaching evaluation process, to actively engage in an ongoing program to develop an understanding and appreciation of other cultures in order to infuse effectively their respective curriculum with multicultural perspectives. According to Jones & Young (1995), "Long term faculty development programs will be needed so that faculty can develop new course materials, teaching strategies and classroom management techniques that reflect sensitivity to the multicultural perspective" (p.172).

If the faculty at each institution is to be successful with this integration process, the administration must provide the necessary financial backing. Given the necessary finances for such a project, the faculty should begin by realizing that this new endeavor is a part of the overall required duties for their annual evaluation. When the administration provides the time, resources, mentors, and scholarship, faculty must respond by exploring, studying, and developing new course materials. The summer, for example, will provide enough time to develop and enhance existing courses with different perspectives. The faculty must first be willing to alter their traditional method of teaching to include issues that relate to other cultures.

The issue of academic freedom is sure to be one of concern for many faculty members. One cannot dictate what faculty members teach within the borders of their discipline. However, when the mission of the system and institution changes to one of integration of multiculturalism, the faculty members have choices. They may either participate, choose not to teach in the system, or continue to teach and perhaps not share in the normal reward system.

Realizing that those instructors who teach the "hard" disciplines, such as mathematics, may have a more difficult time implementing these recommended changes and since the pace of change will be slower, the administration should make some concessions while assessing fairly to determine what progress is being made. Progress, and only progress, should be rewarded. Faculty members who oppose the change in missions will be slow to make any progress, if at all. With regard to those faculty members, Jones & Young, (1995) apologetically suggested, "If faculty are not demonstrating how they are addressing such issues in their classes, research, and publications, they should not be recruited, promoted, retained or tenured. Perhaps this sounds harsh, but we don't know how else to measure success" (p. 171).

## Recommendations for Further Research

Further investigation should be undertaken to determine if the ethnicity of faculty members has a direct impact on the amount of multicultural perspectives infused into the courses. This study was limited to faculty members who taught general education courses within three designated occupational-technical programs who were willing to participate in a 45-minute interview. Only one minority, an African American female, consented to be interviewed. Therefore ethnicity could not be measured as a variable in this study. A study to determine if the ethnicity of faculty who teach general education courses has a direct impact on the amount of multicultural perspectives infused into the program should be undertaken.

The number of faculty members willing to participate was also a limitation as only eighteen readily consented. This small number of faculty made it impossible to determine if all students in the three programs were actually taught by the participating faculty members. A study explicitly designed to ensure that every student enrolled in general education courses is exposed to the teaching of one of the additives or transformers is recommended.

The focus of this study was on the levels of integration faculty members placed based on their course content and teaching philosophy. No mention has been made of whether or not students are benefiting from the infusion. I recommend a study consisting of a pretest and posttest to determine how much of the multicultural concepts and viewpoints students retain from the general education courses. Additionally, evaluation of any post-graduation benefits derived from this multicultural exposure should be included.

In this study, the general education instructors investigated were from three community colleges from a statewide system. Students who attend four-year colleges and universities typically have additional opportunities to receive multicultural perspectives simply because they are usually enrolled in colleges for at least two more years than are community college students. A study, using the same questions and matrix on general education instructors at four-year institutions is recommended. A comparison of the levels of integration at the different types of schools could determine whether or not just community college instructors are deficient in the amount of multicultural education they infuse into their disciplines.

# APPENDIX A:

# LETTER TO PROVOST OR PRESIDENT

Date

Inside Address
Number and Street
City and State, Zip Code

Dear

I am a doctoral student at the College of William and Mary in the School of Education's Higher Education Program. I am soliciting your help in conducting my dissertation study on Multicultural Education and the Community College Curriculum.

Specifically, my study will analyze the content of multicultural education within the occupational/technical programs from three community colleges in the Virginia Community College System. My intent is to interview faculty members who teach general education courses to these occupational/technical program students. I realize that, in most cases, the faculty will come from your Arts and Sciences or Humanities Division. I will contact the appropriate Division Chairperson to identify the faculty members to be interviewed. Please be assured that at no time will your name or that of your institution or faculty member be mentioned. There will be complete confidentiality and anonymity for all concerned.

The study will also include an assessment of the faculty members course content which includes the syllabus, class activities, textbooks, course descriptions, goals/objectives and tests. The interview with the faculty will focus on his/her philosophy of discipline teaching. I am particularly anxious to obtain faculty insight on this matter because they interact with students on a daily basis and are more aware of the multicultural perspectives they are presented.

Since timeliness is very important to my study, I will follow-up this letter with a telephone call to your office in a week to find out if you will give me permission to conduct this study at your institution. Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Lillian Hoggard Williams

## APPENDIX B:

## LETTER TO FACULTY MEMBER

Date

Inside Address
Number and Street
City and State, Zip code

Dear Faculty Member:

I am a doctoral student at the College of William and Mary in the School of Education's Higher Education Program. Dr. __________, President of Name of College, has consented to my conducting a study at your institution on Multicultural Education and the Community College Curriculum.

Specifically, my study will concentrate on the multicultural perspectives presented to students who enter the marketplace immediately upon graduation. Your name was given to me by the Department Chair as a faculty member who teaches general education courses. I am soliciting your help in obtaining the necessary information for my study by consenting to a 45 -minute interview focused on your teaching philosophy and the concept of multicultural education.

As a participant in the study, you will also be asked to furnish your course syllabus, goals/objectives of the course, class activities, handouts, tests, and the table of contents from your textbook. I will make copies of these items, if necessary. I have assured your president that at no time will your name or the name of the institution be mentioned in the study. There will be complete confidentiality and anonymity for all concerned.

I will telephone you during the week of ——— as a follow-up to this request. If you consent, we will schedule an interview at that time. If there is a need to contact me, I may be reached at (804) 786-5137.

Thank you for your consideration and assistance with this study.

Sincerely,

Lillian Hoggard Williams

# APPENDIX C:

# INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

## INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

I. Within the last decade or so, much discussion by educators has been on the integration of multicultural education or multiculturalism into the undergraduate curriculum.

- A. your definition of multicultural education
- B. your opinion of this topic

II. Has the debate on multicultural education affected your teaching or discipline in any way? If so, how?

Has it been a topic or issue of concern at this college?

- A. by faculty, either formally or informally
- B. college administrative mandate
- C. system mandate

III. Do you feel pressure to include multicultural perspectives in your classes? If so, from whom and what are their motives for the inclusion?

What drives faculty members to integrate multicultural perspectives into their classes if not mandated?

IV. What message are you sending your students by your selection of the textbook, supplemental readings, handouts and class activities

V. Is one of the goals/objectives of this class to enhance the student's critical thinking and problem solving skills? What kind of techniques and readings do you use? Do you ever use situational ethnic problems or analyze ethnic readings? If not, why not?

VI. The ultimate goal of multiculturalists is to promote cultural pluralism and to assure equal representation of all voices by focusing on world trends, histories, issues, and interpersonal relationships with different peoples of the world.

How do you feel about this goal?

## FIGURE 1

## ANALYTIC MATRIX OF MULTICULTURAL COURSE CONTENT

**Figure 1. ANALYTIC MATRIX OF MULTICULTURAL COURSE CONTENT**

| | SYLLABI/COURSE OUTLINE | | EVALUATION METHOD | | FACULTY SELF REPORT |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Levels of Integration | Goals/Objectives | Course Description | Tests | Class Activities | Discipline Philosophy |
| EXCLUSION APPROACH<br>No mention of multicultural issues | Relates to traditional Western values; no mention of any aspects of multiculturalism | Focus is on traditional values using mainstream curriculum | Focus is on lessons of traditional values using mainstream curriculum as the source | Activities focus on information concerning the dominant culture only | Emphasis is on the Western values; no discussion of multiple perspectives and viewpoints |
| CONTRIBUTIONS APPROACH<br>Ethnic heroes, holidays, foods, dances and artifacts inserted into discussion of mainstream curriculum | Ethnic heroes, holidays, etc. presented and discussed using same criteria as used for selection of mainstream Western heroes and holidays. | Focus is on dominant culture with a few non-radical ethnic heroes included | Name and accomplishment recognition questions | Guest speakers invited for cultural enrichment; special days and events celebrated | Focus is on dominant culture with a few minorities discussed who support the status quo |
| ADDITIVE APPROACH<br>Adding a chapter, book or unit that focuses on specific ethnic groups to the already prescribed curriculum | Introduction of ethnic issues, concepts, problems, etc., emphasizing assimilation of minorities, but preserving the dominant power by isolating ethnic oppression from discussion | Focus is on the realization that all cultural, racial, and ethnic groups have differing points of view on the same issue but value is ethnocentric for dominant group | Name, date, event recognition and short answer essay asking for recall of perspectives that are not relativistic or pluralistic | Supplementary material depict the life, but not struggles, of the minorities in the U.S. or a work by an author from a different culture | Continuation of a focus on European historians or writers and mainstream historical events and people because no restructuring has taken place |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| TRANSFORMATION APPROACH<br>Basic curricular goals, content and themes are structured to include perspectives from different cultural, ethnic and racial groups | Concepts, issues and problems are presented from the perspectives of the most active participants in the particular event being studied | Focus is on expanding the understanding of how different ethnic groups were influential in shaping the nation from several vantage points | Essay questions which adequately allow students to compare and contrast how ethnic groups participated and influenced the U. S. Society as it relates to the arts, music, history, etc. | Visit the local museum to critique works from other cultures<br>Attend seminars and lectures on artists representing, other cultures and critique the work | Emphasis is on presenting a balanced view of the development of the U. S. culture which allows students to recognize the historical and current injustice to the oppressed groups |
| DECISION - MAKING AND SOCIAL ACTION APPROACH<br>Incorporates all elements of transformation stage while requiring students to make decisions and learn appropriate action to take related to issues, concepts or problems studied | Identify, compare, and analyze social patterns that prohibit social justice and true democratic participation of all citizens | Focus is on understanding and analyzing the developments of non-dominant cultures through arts, history, literature, etc and methods of change to achieve justice among the victimized cultures | Content of report or case study must include evidence of decision - making skills that require the identification or invention of a local ethnic problem, gathering and synthesizing of data, and making an analysis of the problem. | In small groups, teach and allow students to analyze case studies and critique interdisciplinary readings by interrogating and gathering relevant data | Emphasis is on helping students to acquire the necessary knowledge, skills and values to resolve social problems and to achieve equitable representation of minorities by accepting each individual unconditionally. |
| INTEGRATED APPROACH<br>Promotes cultural pluralism by focusing on world trends, developments, histories, issues, and changes and by accepting other Viewpoints and cultures | Focus is on finding ways to encourage pluralism by the inclusion of experiences, cultures, histories and beliefs of different ethnic and religious groups as it relates to music, art, history, social problems, etc | Focus is on the beliefs, experiences, attitudes, values and history of different ethnic, religious and cultural groups and how they interrelate to truly be accepting of different values and norms | Content would require and evaluate for incorporation of knowledge and value of pluralism into class work | Lectures, seminars, discussions and events would display integrated perspectives and knowledge of cultural pluralism | Emphasis is on assuring that each group experiences equal representation and voice in a democratic environment |

# FIGURE 2

## DISTRIBUTION OF GENERAL EDUCATION COURSES BY INSTITUTION AND DISCIPLINE

FIGURE 2. DISTRIBUTION OF GENERAL EDUCATION COURSES BY INSTITUTION AND DISCIPLINE

| | NURSING | | BUSINESS MANAGEMENT | | ELECTRONICS | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **GREENFIELD** | **Credit** | **Discipline** | **Credits** | **Discipline** | **Credits** | **Discipline** |
| | 6 | English | 6 | English | 6 | English |
| | 3 | Sociology | 3 | Math | 6 | Math |
| | 3 | Psychology | 3 | Psychology | 6 | Electives |
| | 6 | Electives | 3 | Economics | | |
| | | | 3 | Elective | | |
| **UPSTATE** | **Credits** | **Discipline** | **Credits** | **Discipline** | **Credits** | **Discipline** |
| | 6 | English | 6 | English | 6 | English |
| | 6 | Psychology | 3 | Math | 6 | Math |
| | 3 | Sociology | 3 | Economics | 3 | Psychology |
| | 3 | Information Systems | 3 | Psychology | 3 | Elective |
| | | | 3 | Elective | | |
| **FLATLANDS** | **Credits** | **Discipline** | **Credits** | **Discipline** | **Credits** | **Discipline** |
| | 6 | English | 6 | English | 6 | English |
| | 3 | Psychology | 3 | Economics | 6 | Math |
| | 3 | Sociology | 3 | Math | 6 | Electives |
| | 3 | Philosophy | 3 | Psychology | | |
| | 3 | Elective | 3 | Speech | | |

# References

Alba, R. D. (1995, Spring). Assimilation's quiet tide. The Public Interest, (119), 3-19.

Altbach,P. G., Berdahl, R. O., & Gumport, P. J. (1994). Higher education in American society (3rd ed.) Amherst, NY: Promethus Books.

Auster, L. (1994, February 21). Avoiding the issue. National Review, 46 (3), 48-55.

Banks, J. A. (1993). Approaches to multicultural curriculum reform. In J. A. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.) Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives. (pp. 195-214). Needham Heights, MA: Allan and Bacon.

Banks, J. A. (1993, September). Multicultural education: Development, dimensions, and challenges. Phi Delta Kappan, 75 (1), 22-28.

Bennett, C. I. (1995). Comprehensive multicultural education: Theory and practice (3rd. ed.). Needham Heights, MA: Allan and Bacon.

Biglan, A. (1973). The characteristics of subject matter in different academic areas. Journal of Applied Psychology, 57 (3), 195-203.

Bowser, B. P. (1995). Introduction. In B. P. Bowser, T. Jones, and G. A. Young. Toward the multicultural university (pp. xv-xxvi). Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers.

Butler, J. & Schmitz, B. (1992, January/February). Ethnic studies, women's studies, and multiculturalism. Change, 24 (1), 37-41.

Clark, B. R. (1987). The academic life: Small worlds, different worlds. Princeton: The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching.

Commission on the Future of the Community Colleges. (1988). Building communities: A vision for a new century. Washington, DC: American Association of Community and Junior Colleges.

Cortes, C. E. (1991, September/October). Pleuibus and unum: the quest for community amid diversity. Change, 23 (5), 8-13.

Do, V. T. (1996, January/February). Counseling culturally different students in the community college. Community College Journal of Research and Practice, 20(1), 9-21.

Donald, J. C. (1986). Knowledge and the university curriculum. In F. Conrad & J. G. Howarth (Eds.), Curriculum in transition. (pp. 295–307).Needham Heights, MA: Ginn Press.

D'Souza, D. (1991). Illiberal education. New York: Free Press.

D'Souza, D. (1991, March). Illiberal education. Atlantic Monthly, 51-79.

[Flatlands] community college handbook (1998). [City, State: Flatland] Community College.

Foster, L. & Herzog, P. (1994). Defending diversity: Contemporary philosophical perspectives on pluralism and multiculturalism. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press.

Gaff, J. G. (1992, January/February). Beyond politics: The educational issues inherent in multicultural education. Change, 24 (1), 30-35.

Gates, H. L., Jr. (1993). Whose canon is it, anyway? In P. Berman (Ed.), Debating P. C: The controversy over political correctness on college campuses (pp. 190-200). New York: Dell Publishing.

Gordon. T. & Lubiano. W. (1993). The statement of the Black faculty caucus. In P. Berman (Ed.), Debating P. C.: The controversy over political correctness on college campuses. (pp. 240-257). New York: Dell Publishing.

[Greenfield] community college handbook (1997). [City, State: Greenfield] Community College.

Hodgkinson, H. L. (1995). Demographic imperatives for the future. In B. P. Bowser, T. Jones, and G. A. Young (Eds.), Toward the multicultural university. (p. 3-19). Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers

Howe, I. (1993). The value of the canon. In P. Berman (Ed.), Debating P. C.: The controversy over political correctness on college campuses. (pp. 85-123). New York: Dell Publishing.

Hu-Dehart, E. (1993, September). The history, development, and future of ethnic studies. Phi Delta Kappan, 50-54.

Hunt. J. A., Bell, L. A., Wei, W. & Ingle, G. (1992). Monoculturalism to multiculturalism: Lessons from three public universities. In M. Adams (Ed.), Promoting diversity in college classrooms: Innovative responses for the curriculum, faculty and institutions. (pp. 101-113). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Jones. T. & Young, G. A. (1995). Beyond disciplinary borders: Creating a genuine multicultural curriculum. In B. P. Bowser, T. Jones, and G. A. Young (Eds.), Toward the multicultural university. (pp. 161-178). Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers.

Kuhn, T. S. (1970). The structure of scientific revolutions (2nd ed.) Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Levin, A. (1992, January/February). A time to act. Change, 24 (1). 4-5.

Madrid, A. (1990). Diversity and its discontents. Academe, 76(6), 15-19.

[Marantz] Community College System. (1999). [M]CCS Statistical Profile: [Marantz]'s community colleges—building blocks for a better future. [On-line]. Available: World Wide Web: http://[Marantzcc].us.

[Marantz] Community College System. (1999). Photo directory, '98-99. [City, State]: [Marantz] Community College System.

Nieto, S. (1996). Affirming diversity: the sociopolitical context of multicultural education (2nd ed.). White Plains, NY: Longman Publishers.

Piland, W. E. (1996, January/February). Introduction. Community College Journal of Research and Practice, 20(1), iii.

Ramsey, P. G., Vold, E. B., & Williams, L. R.(1989). Multicultural education: A sourcebook . New York: Garland Publishing.

Rhodes, R. A. & Valdez, J. R. (1996). Democracy, multiculturalism, and the community college: A critical perspective. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc.

Schlesinger, A. M. (1992). The disuniting of America. New York: Norton.

Schmitz, B. (1992). Cultural pluralism and core curricular. In M. Adams (Ed.), Promoting diversity in college classrooms: Innovative responses for the curriculum, faculty, and institutions. (pp. 61-69). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Schuster, M. & van Dyne, S. (1984, November). Placing women in the liberal arts: Stages of curriculum transformation. Harvard Educational Review, 54 (4), 413-428.

Shaw, P. (1994, Spring). The assault on the canon. Sewanee Review, 102 (2), 257-270.

Searle, J. (1993). The storm over the university. In P. Berman (Ed.), Debating P. C.: The controversy over political correctness on college campuses. (pp. 85-123). New York: Dell Publishing.

Stoll, M. P. (1994-95, December/January). What is multicultural education? Community College Journal, 65 (3), 11-15.

Takaki, R. (1994). A different mirror: A history of multicultural America. Boston, MA: Little, Brown and Company.

2000 CEO diversity roundtable. (2000, July). Black Enterprise, 30 (12), 136.

[Upstate] community college handbook (1997). [City, State: Upstate] Community College.

Wallin, D. (1996, January/February). Multicultural education and the vocational/technical student. Community College Journal of Research and Practice, 20 (1), 23-34.

Weber, R. P. (1990). Basic content analysis (2nd ed.), Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

Webster's new world dictionary of American English (3rd college ed.). (1994). New York: Macmillan Company.

Willard, S. M. (1993, May). Teaching a multiculturalism humanities curriculum in the "P.C." era. Paper presented at the Annual International Conference of the National Institute for Staff and Organizational Development on Teaching Excellence, Austin, TX.

# Vita

Lillian Hoggard Williams

Birthdate: August 12, 1948

Birthplace: Ahoskie, North Carolina

Education:

| | |
|---|---|
| 1993-2000 | The College of William and Mary<br>Williamsburg, Virginia<br>School of Education |
| 1973-1973 | The University of Michigan<br>Ann Arbor, Michigan<br>Master of Arts in Library Science |
| 1966-1970 | Winston-Salem State University<br>Winston-Salem, North Carolina<br>Bachelor of Arts |